WEDNESDAY, MARCH 22, 2023

1:22 P.M.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The House will come to order.

His Eminence Archbishop Elpidophoros will offer a prayer.

ARCHBISHOP ELPIDOPHOROS: Let us bow our heads in prayer. In the name of God, the Creator and Sustainer of the universe and all that is contained therein, amen. We offer thanks and praise, O God, for gathering us together today in this legislative Assembly of the great State of New York. That we may appeal to Your righteousness and goodness to bless all representatives of the people with Your mercy and grace. Grant on to them to fulfill their duties, responsibilities and obligations to the people with honor, with integrity and unallied allegiance to the Constitution. Hold them fast in

MARCH 22, 2023

Your loving care that they may ever serve with the dignity of their high office. And thus render glory, reverence and honor to You, the fountain head of all law and justice, amen.

MEMBERS: Amen.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Visitors are invited to join the members in the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Whereupon, Acting Speaker Aubry led visitors and members in the Pledge of Allegiance.)

A quorum being present, the Clerk will read the Journal of Tuesday, March the 21st.

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Mr. Speaker, I move to dispense with the further reading of the Journal of March the 21st and ask that the same stand approved.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Without objection, so ordered.

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Thank you, Mr.

Speaker. Colleagues and guests that are in the Chambers, I would like to begin our day rather than a quote today we're going to use an African proverb. This one is: *If you want to go quickly, go alone. If you want to go far, go together*. Again, Mr. Speaker, that's an African proverb that was -- thought would be appropriate to share with our colleagues today. I want to say that the members do have on their desks a main Calendar and after you have done any introductions

and/or housekeeping we are going to be taking up the following Committees. We're going to call these following committees off the floor, Codes and Rules. These meetings are going to produce an A-Calendar of which we plan to take up today. We will begin our work on the floor right now by taking up resolutions on page 3 of which some members do want to make comment. After that we are going to go to Calendar No. 32 on page 8, it will be on debate by Mr. Aubry, sir. As we proceed there could be a need to do additional floor work but we will advise at that point. At the conclusion of today we actually are going to be taking up a series of rules changes that have been proposed by the Minority. With that as a general outline, Mr. Speaker, if you have introductions or housekeeping, now would be a great time, sir. Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: No housekeeping, Mrs. Peoples-Stokes, but we do have introductions.

> Mr. Tannousis for the purposes of a introduction. MR. TANNOUSIS: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It is

my pleasure to introduce today on the floor of the New York State Assembly his Eminence Archbishop Elpidophoros of the Greek Orthodox Church of the Americas. He is the leader of a Greek Orthodox Church which encompasses over 500 parishes in the United States, 800 priests and counts over two million faithful throughout the United States. He is here today in honor of our resolution to recognize March as Greek History Month in the State of New York. Mr. Speaker, I ask you to extend all the cordialities of the House to His

MARCH 22, 2023

Eminence and join me in doing so. Thank you very much.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Certainly. On behalf of Mr. -- oh, I'm sorry. Mr. Smullen on the same -- no, sorry. On behalf of Mr. Tannousis, the Speaker and all the members, Archbishop we welcome you here to the New York State Assembly. We extend to you the privileges of the floor. Thank you for sharing those great words with us this morning. Know that you are all welcome here and I understand the weight of the importance of the office that you hold. Thank you so very much.

(Applause)

For the purposes of an introduction, Ms. Seawright.

MS. SEAWRIGHT: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I'm pleased to introduce a guest from Manhattan here in the Chamber today with me, Wendy Diamond who is a true force for good in the world. She is the founder of Women's Entrepreneurship Day Organization, a global movement that empowers four billion women and girls worldwide to be catalyst for change and uplift the 388 million who live in poverty. Ten years ago an official proclamation recognizing Women's Entrepreneurship Day in New York State was issued recognizing the important day. Today this global movement is celebrated in 144 countries around the world. A testament to Wendy's unwavering commitment to her empowering women and girls everywhere. I ask that you please extend to her the courtesies of the House. Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Certainly. On behalf

MARCH 22, 2023

of Ms. Seawright, the Speaker and all the members, we welcome you here to the New York State Assembly. We extend to you the privileges of the floor. Thank you for the work that you're doing in empowering women in the State of New York and around the world. This House is a demonstration of that empowerment, the many women who have come and joined us over these years has made us more inclusive and a better lawmaking Body. Thank you for your work.

(Applause)

And now Mr. Smullen for the purposes of a introduction.

MR. SMULLEN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. It gives me great pleasure and it's a great honor today to provide an introduction to the Fulton County Treasurer, Heather Scribner who has joined us in Chambers today. As you all know local government is very important and the treasurer's office is one of those local offices where the dollars and cents need to make sense. And the people in Fulton County are very fortunate to have elected their first woman treasurer in the person of Heather Scribner who has been filling that office for several years now. So if you could, if you could extend the cordialities of the House to our esteemed guest Miss Heather Scribner, we would appreciate it very much. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Certainly. On behalf of Mr. Smullen, the Speaker and all the members, Heather, I may use the term, I welcome you here to the New York State Assembly,

commend you on the work that you're doing to keep the finances straight. Always put a woman in charge of the money, I've always been told that, especially by women. So we will -- happy to have you. Hope that you will continue that great work and know that you are always welcome here in Albany. Thank you so very much.

(Applause)

Mr. Lemondes for the purposes of a introduction.

MR. LEMONDES: Thank you, Mr. Speaker and fellow colleagues. Please allow me to interrupt the proceedings to introduce a fellow parishioner at St. Sophia's Greek Orthodox Church who hails from the very center of our great State -- great State in Syracuse Mr. Ted Limpert. Ted has practiced law for 34 years and is currently serving as an Onondaga County Court Judge after winning his election in November. Prior to that he was the Syracuse City Court Judge presiding over human trafficking intervention, trafficking itself and veterans treatment courts. He is also a member of the Statewide Judicial Committee on Human Trafficking and the Human Trafficking Task Force. Ted is also a highly-decorated retired colonel from the New York Air National Guard serving from 1982 to 2012 as an F-16 and A-10 Warhawk Pilot with 106 combat missions through seven deployments through Southwest Asia. Totaling 3,100 military hours plus an additional 1,850 civilian hours, he is the recipient of the Distinguished Flying Cross with valor and several other meritorious achievement, liberation and campaign, medals and awards. Perhaps most importantly though is his civic commitment to those in need

volunteering for Honor Flight to help veterans get to Washington, D.C. as well as his desire to help anyone in need. He has personally flown some of our parishioners out-of-state for medical emergencies in his own aircraft as well as driven them when weather was inconducive to flight. He is active in many Greek-American professional athletic, local -- and local activities, is a proud husband and father of four lovely children and a pillar of our community. Mr. Speaker, please welcome and provide Mr. Limpert the cordialities of the House.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Certainly. On behalf of Mr. Lemondes, the Speaker and all the members, Your Honor we welcome you here to the New York State Assembly, the People's House. We extend to you the privileges of the floor and our congratulations for a life of service, a well-deserved congratulations it seems from all that you've done. We hope that you will continue that great work and continue taking care of the people of both your community and this State and we hope that you will be safe in your travels as you proceed back home. Thank you so very much for sharing with us.

(Applause)

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Just for an point of personal privilege, I had a dear friend Mark Croce who was a pilot as well and his plane ran into some issues and he did not survive. But I do want to take an opportunity to honor

MARCH 22, 2023

the life of Clyde Vanel, because his plane ran into some difficulty as well but he landed safely and he's right here in the Chambers with us today.

(Applause)

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Ms. Peoples-Stokes. I did note that Mr. Vanel went over and was the first to greet the -- the honorable judge who also was a pilot. And so we hope they shared some thoughts and that Mr. Vanel will continue to fly safely, Mr. Vanel, as you take off in your world. Thank you.

(Applause)

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes for the purposes of a

announcement.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Mr. Speaker, would you

please call the Codes Committee to the Speaker's Conference Room?

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Codes Committee, Speaker's Conference Room immediately, please. We will proceed to page 3, resolutions, Assembly print 211, the Clerk will read.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. 211, Ms. Jackson.

Legislative Resolution memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim March 22, 2023, as Water Day in the State of New York.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: On the resolution, all those in favor signify by saying aye; opposed, no. The resolution is -- oh, I'm sorry.

Ms. Jackson on the resolution.

MARCH 22, 2023

MS. JACKSON: Now I have to say an extra thank you, Mr. Speaker, for allowing me to speak on this resolution. Today is known as Water Day and all my Caribbean people and soaker lovers know we are supposed to drink water and mind our business, but today we're going to talk about the business of water. We observe Water Day to promote the responsible use of water and access to safe water for everyone. Thank you, Mr. Speaker, for drinking while I speak. We all need safe drinking water to survive, but water is also necessary for our agriculture, our recreation, our health care, hygiene, sanitation and so much more. Because I live in an older apartment building, every once in a while they'll cut the water off so they can do repairs, and it's unbearable just those few hours to go without water because during that time I'm not able to wash my hands after I prepare a meal or wash my dishes after I prepare a meal or wash my clothes. Oh, and as you can imagine I can't wash other things, right? So, but the worst part was when the water is cut off during COVID and we were -- the height of COVID and we were encouraging everyone to wash their hands repeatedly to keep us safe from the germs, the bacteria, the viruses that were spreading around. So I just can't imagine what's it's like to live in Flint, Michigan and not have safe drinking water. But today I just want to continue to encourage us to understand that we are lucky to be in the State of New York because, you know, we take extra precautions to keep our waterways safe. I am encouraging all of us to -- to drink the recommended six to eight ounces -- six to eight cups of water a day to keep us healthy and

maintain our health. I must also say that I am encouraging us today to use non-plastic water bottles to reduce the waste that we see happening in our -- in our environment. And also to keep the forever chemicals that come from plastic out of our waterways. I am reminded today that we should also be very grateful for the safe drinking waters that we have in New York and I want to say thank you, Mr. Speaker, for allowing me to speak.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Ms. Jackson. On the resolution, all those in -- oh, I'm sorry. I'm rushing it through.

Mr. Burke on the resolution.

MR. BURKE: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I'd like to thank Ms. Jackson for this resolution. I live in Buffalo, New York which is along Lake Erie, the Great Lakes. The largest source of fresh water possibly in the world and it's abundantly clear that we have to do more. I think this Body does a lot to protect our waterways but it was in 2014 in Toledo, Ohio, a city situated on a Great Lake, the whole City of Toledo shut down because they did not have access to fresh water. So we look at this resolution, we -- we think about the two billion people in the world who don't have access to clean drinking water and it's unfortunate there's a whole lot of them that live in the United States of America and it's unacceptable. So thank you, Ms. Jackson, for this resolution and I'm happy to -- to recognize it today as well.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, sir.

Mr. Jacobson on the resolution.

MR. JACOBSON: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I applaud the sponsor for putting in this resolution. And it's so important because what we need to do now is recommit ourselves to making sure that we don't have PFAS or PFOS or all those forever chemicals in -- in our water as what happened in the Hudson Valley due to the runoff from Stewart Airport that contaminated the drinking water of the City of Newburgh so that we're now hooked up to the Catskill Aqueduct. But the other thing we have to do is we should once and for all commit and promise to get the lead out. So let's fund the lead service line replacement program so that we can get the lead out of our drinking water. Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mr. Jacobson.

Ms. Kelles on the resolution.

MS. KELLES: I, too, want to thank the -- the sponsor Ms. Jackson for bringing this forward. It's so important and we don't talk about it enough. We have some of the last fresh water on the planet, surface fresh water on the planet in New York State. I -- I can't emphasize enough how important that is because once it is contaminated that's it. And it is one of the most important economic development resources that we have, tourism resources, health resources, natural environment, ecosystem preservation, resources, priorities that we have in -- in our environmental agenda in this State for that reason. I did want to point out a few things that we need to

MARCH 22, 2023

address to protect that. For example, Cayuga Lake which is in my district right now has salt mines from a private company that span the breadth of the underneath the lake back and forth and back and forth and back and forth underneath the lake, tunneled underneath the lake millions and trillions of tons of water above that because it is easier to get a permit from the State than it is to get a permit from every individual personal homeowner. So they've done it under the lake risking the potential of collapse, which has already happened once in New York State. We have issues that we do need to address and we need to stay vigilant, the lead, the PFAS. We aren't even testing, let alone disclosing, some of the major sources of PFAS that are actually releasing water -- releasing into our fresh water. So they're steps we need to take and we need to remember every single day that this is the lifeblood of our State. Thank you so much for bringing this forward and the celebration and honoring of the water that keeps us alive and our survival. Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you.

On the resolution, all those in favor signify by saying aye; opposed, no. The resolution is adopted.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. 212, Ms. Dickens. Legislative Resolution memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim March 22, 2023, as Puerto Rican Emancipation Day in the State of New York.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: On the resolution, Mr. Dilan.

MR. DILAN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Today I rise on behalf of my colleague and good friend Inez -- Inez Dickens who could not be here for reasons that are personal to her to speak on this resolution to commemorate and proclaim March 22, 2023, as Puerto Rican Emancipation Day in the State of New York. In my everevolving knowledge and education of my history, I learned from her staff member who served her long Mr. Richard (indiscernible) who I want to thank personally for giving me this education that in the early 1500s the crown of Spain authorized the importation of African slaves into Puerto Rico to work the gold mines and the fields once the Spaniards decimated the Taíno workforce population that was working in Puerto Rico at the time with disease and infection they brought from Europe. For over 300 years, African slaves worked in treacherous conditions under the Caribbean sun. They withstood abuses from slave owners and were killed when they revolted or attempted escapes. And with the hard work of a handful of abolitionists and -- and others, the African slaves were freed from the Spanish crown on March 22nd, this day, in 1873. And Assemblymember Dickens and the members who sponsored the resolution, she sends her thanks that the message -- and -- and also wants to say that the message of slavery anywhere in the world is wrong and must be eliminated at all cost. So she asks you to celebrate this day with us, our Puerto Rican brothers and sisters in support of passing this resolution. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mr.

Dilan.

Mr. Rivera on the resolution.

MR. RIVERA: Good morning, Mr. Speaker. I'll just echo the sentiments of my colleague Mr. Dilan and thank Assemblymember Dickens for bringing this forward. Today we commemorate the abolishing of slavery and the freedom of tens of thousands of African slaves on the Island of Puerto Rico. Sadly history shows us that those supposed free Afro-Puerto Ricans were obligated and to continue to work for their enslavers for at least three years after the abolishment. And those same slave owners also received compensation from the Spanish government for their supposed losses. Fast forward, the Island has had its setbacks when it comes to freedom. Today and throughout Puerto Rican history we have fought in every major American war including World War I and World War II, but when our soldiers returned back to the Island, they're still not able to vote for the president of the nation that they just defended. We have the Jones Act that cripples our economy. And just as recently as last year in an 8 to 1 vote, the Supreme Court ruled that Puerto Ricans don't have the constitutional right that other Americans have. In her statement, Justice Sotomayor said because residents of Puerto Rico do not have voting representation in Congress they cannot rely on their elected representatives to remedy the punishing disparities suffered by citizen residents of Puerto Rico under Congresses unequal treatment. Today we recognize the freedom and the successes that we've had as an Island, one by

MARCH 22, 2023

NYS ASSEMBLY

celebrating today as we should, but two by advocating for the fulfillment of our freedoms and for the generations ahead of us of those who live on the Island. Thank you very much.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mr. Rivera.

On the resolution all those in favor signify by saying aye; opposed, no. The resolution is adopted.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. 213, Mr. Tannousis.

Legislative Resolution memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim March 2023, as Greek History Month in the State of New York in conjunction with the commemoration of the 202nd Anniversary of Greek Independence.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Lemondes on the resolution.

MR. LEMONDES: I would like to thank the sponsor for putting this forward on behalf of all Greek people worldwide. Thank you. Greek Independence Day established on March 15th, 1838, designated March 25th as an eternal in perpetuity national holiday celebrated in Greece, Cyprus and the Greek diaspora worldwide. It traditionally commemorates the start of the Greek War of Independence against the Ottoman Empire in 1821. Additionally, there are more than five million people of Greek origin living outside of Greece scattered in 140 countries across the globe. However, New York has the largest Greek American population totaling around 300,000 with the majority located in New York -- in the New York

MARCH 22, 2023

Metropolitan area and the rest of us scattered throughout the State and nation in smaller communities. It is traditionally held that the -- that the War of Greek Independence started at the Saint Lavra Monastery with the swearing in of the military leadership by the Bishop -- by Bishop Germanos in 1821. The fighting would last approximately eight years until an armistice was agreed upon. And in 1832 Greece was reestablished as an independent kingdom from the Ottoman Empire with the Treaty of Constantinople. Assisting the Greeks with their war for independence were Britain, France and Russia. American support of the War of Greek Independence helped fuel important social causes in the United States including the abolitionists and Women's Suffrage Movements. Additionally, the history of Greeks in North America is as old as the United State -- States itself with the establishment of a Greek colony and Spanish-held Florida in 1776 at St. Augustine. Ladies and gentlemen, in recognition of Greek independence, Greek contributions to humanity, the United States and democratic governments throughout the world, please join me in honoring and acknowledging the importance of this day. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, sir. Mr. Jensen on the resolution.

MR. JENSEN: Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker, on the resolution. As this Body's representative of the Town of Greece, I want to say to "efharisto" to Mr. Lemondes and Mr. Tannousis for their sponsorship of this resolution. On behalf of all

Greecians in my town - that's what we call ourselves - I want to recognize the importance of Greek history and its influence not just on our country but on our State. Our town was renamed in honor of the Greek battle for independence against the Ottoman Empire. Our high schools in the Greece School District are named -- inspired by Greek history and we have some terrific Greek diners. So, on behalf of the -the folks I represent, thank you and I look forward to celebrating Greek history month all of March. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mr. Jensen.

Ms. González-Rojas.

MS. GONZÁLEZ-ROJAS: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. During last year's redistricting process I was thrilled to have my Queens district expanded to include Astoria. As the representative of the heart of Greek life and culture in New York, I am honored to speak in support of this resolution commemorating Greek History Month. According to the most recent US Census data, over 30,000 New Yorkers of Greek descent live in Queens. Over the course of generations, the Greek community in Assembly District 34 has built a thriving little Greece full of small businesses, places of worship, cultural institutions, schools and for me, which I love, restaurants. Astoria is a testament to the hard work, commitment and resilience of Greek immigrants old and new and their lasting impact on the social and cultural life of New York City. I think almost every Greek New Yorker I meet has lived in Astoria at some point in their life. So I am

MARCH 22, 2023

humbled to represent such a vibrant Greek community and I happily join my colleagues in voting yes on this resolution. Thank you so much.

> ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you. Mr. Sayegh.

MR. SAYEGH: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Also would like to rise to commend the sponsors in the celebration of Greek history and it's all well-known from the days of Plato and Socrates the impact that the Greeks have had on world civilization is pretty well-known to all of us. And as a member of the Eastern rites of the Christian Church, today's presence of His Eminence, you know, leading us in the prayer was also very special. So I'd like to join in celebrating Greek American History Month and hope that we can continue to appreciate and promote respect for each other and diversity at all levels. Thank you.

> ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, sir. Mr. Tannousis.

MR. TANNOUSIS: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Mr. Speaker, New York State is home to over 30,000 Greek Americans. They attend their local Greek Orthodox churches in various parts -parts of the State to participate -- to practice their religion and to stay connected to their culture. Today we're visited by the head of the Greek Orthodox Church for the Americas, Archbishop Elpidophoros. And like many immigrant groups, Greek Americans immigrated to the land of opportunity in pursuit of the American Dream. And I have to

MARCH 22, 2023

say, Greek Americans have contributed greatly to the fabric of our nation and to our State and how can they not? The Greeks invented democracy, have made important contributions to philosophy, mathematics, astronomy, medicine, literature and theater. It was also an important part of the culture which influenced modern drama. The Greeks were known for their sophisticated sculpture and architecture. The Greeks have truly shaped our modern civilization as we know it today. In honor of Greek Independence Day which is on March 25th, 2023, and in honor of our resolution today celebrating Greek history, I say long live Greece or as in Greek zíto i Elláda. Thank you very much.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mr. Tannousis.

Mr. Mamdani.

MR. MAMDANI: Thank you, sir. I rise today because I also have the great privilege alongside my colleague to represent a significant portion of Astoria. I know better than to say the best Greek restaurant in my neighborhood, but I do want to say that Astoria would not be Astoria were it not for the Greek community that makes it up. It is the center of our community and so many of us gather at one of the most beautiful illustrations of that which is Athens Square Park. And you know I've heard a lot today about the beautiful contributions that the Greek people have given us in terms of history, in terms of democracy, in terms of the arts, in terms of theater, but I must also rise today to recognize the contributions of the Greek

national team in the European Championships of 2004 who prevailed against all odds and became the European Champions, specifically a goal by Theodoros Zagorakis. So I thank you all for this. I thank the sponsor for this resolution and I thank so many of my Greek constituents for making our neighborhood what it is. Thank you, Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mr. Mamdani.

Mr. Braunstein.

MR. BRAUNSTEIN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker, for the opportunity to speak on this resolution. I want to thank the sponsor Mr. Tannousis first for bringing His Imminence the Archbishop here to lead us in the opening prayer today. It was an honor to have the opportunity to meet him. And I also want to thank the sponsor for introducing this resolution commemorating the 202nd day of Greek independence. Greece and the United States over those 200 years have a longstanding friendship based on our shared democratic values. That alliance is further strengthened with the Greek Americans living here in the United States who have ties to both countries. I happen to represent a large Greek American population in my district in northeast Queens. My colleagues from Astoria, a lot of those constituents either live in Astoria or still have family who live in Astoria and I have the opportunity to witness firsthand the tremendous contributions that community has on the neighborhoods in my district but also on our City and our State and

MARCH 22, 2023

our country. So, it's an honor to have the opportunity to cosponsor this resolution and speak on it and I wish the United States and Greece another 200 years of shared friendship and allyship that endures. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, sir. On the resolution all those in favor signify by saying aye; opposed, no. The resolution is adopted.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. 214, Ms. Rajkumar.

Legislative Resolution memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim March 26th, 2023, as Bangladesh Independence Day in the State of New York.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Ms. Rajkumar on the resolution.

MS. RAJKUMAR: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Today the State Assembly pauses in its deliberations to recognize March 26th, 2023 as Bangladesh Independence Day in the State of New York. This resolution is cosponsored by my colleagues Downstate and Upstate as we all join together in the Chamber to collectively recognize the powerful and emergent Bangladeshi community. We are proud that New York State has the largest percentage of Bangladesh Americans of any state in the entire country. As the first woman of South-Asian ancestry ever elected to the Legislature in our great State, I introduce this resolution with enormous pride. The South Asian community is finally here. We have arrived at the table of government in New York State. When our Founding Father fought

MARCH 22, 2023

for American independence, Patrick Henry famously said "Give me liberty or give me death." Two centuries later Bangladesh fought its own war for independence. Sheikh Mujibur Rahman was the father of the nation. He was imprisoned and placed in solitary confinement. He emerged victorious and became the first prime minister of the new Bangladesh. He gave his life for the nation and he and his family were tragically assassinated, but his daughter survived. Sheikh Hasina, today she is the Prime Minister of Bangladesh and the longest-serving woman head of government in the world. Under her leadership, the US Department of State cites Bangladesh as a global example of a democratic, tolerant, pluralistic and modern nation. Today's resolution honors Bangladesh's freedom fighters who bravely puts their lives on the line for independence. When the freedom fighters fought, the entire world supported their cause. I am proud to say that some of those freedom fighters now live in New York where they are revered by the community. Today is their day. Today New York State honors their courage and the Bangladeshi's community fight for freedom and greatness now continues here in the United States. Like my own parents when they immigrated from South Asia, Bangladeshi Americans are hard-working working 25 hours a day to achieve the American Dream for themselves and their children. Bangladeshi Americans today are thriving in the fields of medicine, engineering, business, finance and information technology. They are also our ride-share and taxi drivers, construction workers, small business owners, and service industry employees, upon which our

economy depends. And most of all, they are proud Americans with high aspirations. Today the State Assembly will join more than 200,000 Bangladesh Americans across our country to recognize March 26th, 2023, as Bangladesh Independence Day in the State of New York. Dhonnobad. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you.

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes for the purposes of a introduction and then we will go back to resolutions.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Mr. Speaker, would you please call the Rules Committee to the Speaker's Conference Room? ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Rules Committee,

Speaker's Conference Room immediately, please.

Ms. Hyndman on the resolution.

MS. HYNDMAN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker, for allowing me to speak on this resolution. I would like to congratulate my colleague on introducing this resolution to recognize the 52nd year of independence for the nation of Bangladesh. This country is a mere 52 years old and it was a hard-fought battle against Pakistan which claimed the lives of almost three million Bangladeshis through hardfought wars and genocide. This country has come a very long way being that they're one of the fastest growing economies in the world. They are moving so fast they had Uber before we did in this State. I would also like to recognize all of the constituents in Southeast Queens in 29th Assembly District and wish them a happy 52nd anniversary and also say (speaking foreign language).

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you.

Ms. Reyes for purposes of a introduction.

MS. REYES: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I would also like to join my colleagues and congratulate the sponsor of this resolution. New York City is home to the largest and most vibrant Bangladeshi community in the United States. According to the Asian American Federation Census Information Center, New York City's Bangladeshi population was amongst the fastest growing Asian ethnic group. In my district, Bangladeshi -- my Bangladeshi community has actually doubled. In Parkchester specifically, the Bangladeshi American community has many businesses that line Starling Avenue with a variety of clothing stores, food markets, South Asian restaurants in a corridor that New York City has called the Bangla Bazaar. The Bangladeshi community I represent are passionate about the pursuit of the American Dream whether through education, entrepreneurship, cultural emersion, labor organizing or civic engagement. I can always feel their passion and count on their commitment in service to our community. I am so incredibly fortunate to have an embrace by the Bangladeshi brothers and sisters in my community and I am known locally by my neighbors as Karina Apa which means sister. As we commemorate the 52nd anniversary of their independence, I'd like to recognize and celebrate the powerful and emerging Bangladeshi community and their endless pursuit for freedom and equity both in their native home of Bangladesh and their adoptive home - the greatest borough of course in New York City -

the Bronx. Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER TAYLOR: Ms. Lucas on the resolution.

MS. LUCAS: Thank you, Speaker and thank you to the sponsor for bringing forth this resolution. Today we celebrate the country of Bangladesh commemorated on March 26th, 1971 when Sheikh Mujibur Rahman made a Declaration of Independence from Pakistan. Those of us assembled here today understand that freedom isn't free. And while we celebrate their independence we should also remember those whose lives were sacrificed to obtain this freedom. East New York is home to a growing group of immigrants whose roots are in Bangladesh. While we recognize it today, I want to acknowledge the Bangladesh's community in my district as they celebrate Bangladesh's Independence Day on March 26th. The Bangladesh community exemplifies independence through its social and economic development that they bring to our communities throughout the State of New York. So on behalf of the members of my district of Bengali descent, I honor, celebrate and wish you a happy and festive independence day.

ACTING SPEAKER TAYLOR: Mr. Weprin on the resolu -- Mr. Weprin on the resolution.

MR. WEPRIN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I, too, want to acknowledge and support this very important resolution. I have probably one of the largest Bangladeshi American populations in the State in my district. I represent Jamaica Hill among other areas

MARCH 22, 2023

where -- which is the site of the largest mosque in New York City by population, 9,000 members most of whom are of Bangladeshi descent. I currently have two Bangladeshi American staffers and have had five or six other Bangladeshi American staffers over the years. So I want to join with the sponsor of this resolution in celebrating Bangladeshi Independence Day. I have a number of freedom fighters in my Assembly District and of course the whole community is very proud of them. The Bangladeshi American community in my district in Queens makes a huge contribution to health care in New York State. They were on the front lines during the COVID-19 pandemic and participated in so many different food distributions, but there's so many doctors and nurses and -- and other medical personnel from the Bangladeshi American community. So I want to join in celebrating Independence Day and supporting this resolution. Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER TAYLOR: Mr. Sayegh on the resolution.

MR. SAYEGH: Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. I wanted to also join in thanking the sponsor and recognizing New York State and our nation has really become and emerged into a very diversified country of many ethnicities and cultures and often as we celebrate cultural diversity and heritage and traditions and often we celebrate independence. And we know from our experience from 1776 how it is to get your independence and freedom. So this is why we celebrate independence, we celebrate whenever a group comes to our nation and opens businesses and gets involved in the fabric of our

society and it's really part of the American tradition. We've become a melting pot because we've embraced the differences and we've enjoyed this together to make us a great State. So I join in celebrating the Bangladesh and American community and their accomplishments for our State. Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER TAYLOR: Thank you, Ms. González-Rojas on the resolution.

MS. GONZÁLEZ-ROJAS: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I'm really proud to rise in support of this resolution as I, too, represent a large and vibrant and powerful Bangladeshi population in Jackson Heights. From 2010 to 2015 the Bangladeshi population in New York City increased 88 percent to 66,000 members. It has grown faster than all the populations amongst the Asian populations in New York City. Most of them live in Queens, and in Queens as we are the world's borough celebrating the diversity of the world I want to honor and recognize the leadership of our Bangladeshi community members, we have vibrant small businesses, restaurants and cultural institutions, places of faith and we are home to organizations like the Jackson Heights Bangladeshi Business Association and we have leadership of folks representing organizations like Bangladeshi Americans for Political Progress. And in fact this Sunday we will be naming 73rd Street between 37th Avenue and Broadway Bangladesh Street. So I'm really thrilled to be here to celebrate a Bangladeshi American community, myself and the districts that surround us, District 39 and 30 which make up such a large and vibrant community. So thank you

apologies.

MARCH 22, 2023

to the sponsor for this resolution. I'm proud to join my colleagues and voting in the affirmative.

ACTING SPEAKER TAYLOR: Thank you. Ms. McMahon on the resolution.

MS. MCMAHON: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. And my congratulations to the sponsor of this very important resolution. I, too, represent a very significant and active Bangladeshi community in the 146 Assembly District, district up in Western, New York. I'd like to wish my Bangladeshi constituents a very happy Independence Day and I'd like to give a shout-out to an organization in my district called BASCO, the Bangladeshi American Social and Cultural Organization. I want to thank them for their engagement in our community. They were a moving force behind an earlier resolution that I had celebrating Mother Language Day and I look forward to working with them to make our community always a better place. Thank you so much.

ACTING SPEAKER TAYLOR: Thank you.

Ms. People-Stokes for -- on the resolution, my

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Thank you, Mr. Speaker, for the opportunity to make comments on this and other resolutions that we've heard today. I first want to say that my district of 141st has probably gained more population from the Bangladesh community more than any other population that is coming into that district. And I'm honored to have them. They are committed citizens and they -- they work hard and it's -- it's a great opportunity to have

MARCH 22, 2023

them join my district. But I also want to say this as it relates to the Greek Independence Day as well as the Puerto Rican Emancipation Day, what value we have spoke here today in these Chambers in respecting peoples' heritage, respecting peoples' culture and honoring American history, this is what we're talking about here today. And when you look across the scope of this country there are many people who want to deny history, they don't even want you talking about it. And here we are in our Chambers doing exactly what we should be doing, honoring the people who contribute to make this country great. What a pleasure it is. So I want to commend all of the sponsors. Inez Dickens, Mr. Tannousis and Ms. Rajkumar for introducing these resolutions today that allow us to celebrate American history. Thank you all so much.

ACTING SPEAKER TAYLOR: Thank you.

On the resolution, all those in favor signify by saying aye; opposed, no. The resolution is adopted.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. 215, Mr. Gibbs.

Legislative Resolution memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim June 7th through the 13th, 2023, as Heart Rhythm Week week in the State of New York.

ACTING SPEAKER TAYLOR: Mr. Gibbs on the

resolution.

MR. GIBBS: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I rise today about my resolution for Heart Rhythm Week. This resolution is vital to raise awareness about arrhythmias and heart rates. Arrhythmia is a

condition where the heartbeat is irregular meaning beating too fast or too slow which can cause serious side effects such as irregular breathing, chest pains, lightheadedness, or even cardiac arrest. It's important that we as a legislative Body recognize this medical issue as in many cases it gets overlooked which is why I'm proud to sponsor this resolution and urge my colleagues to join me in recognizing the week of June 7th to the 13th as Heart Rhythm Week in New York State. Yet this resolution is near and dear to my heart. Everyone experiencing arrhythmia at some point in their lives, everyone experience it. While it may be harmless for those free of heart disease, some irregular heartbeats can be serious or fatal such as my daughter Ariel Gibbs. Ariel was born with a heart murmur and as she grew older it advanced. The arrythmia was too much that when she became 21 and after giving birth to her second son, her heart enlarged and we lost her. March 25th would have made her 28th birthday. But I'm blessed because she left us two boys, Ian and (inaudible) Cameron. But more importantly, Mr. Speaker, I want to thank Members Hyndman, Peoples-Stokes, Brian Cunningham, Alex Bores, Tony Simone, De Los Santos, Al Taylor as well as staffers Deb Miller, Nellie and Wayne Jackson. See these wonderful individuals know that I'm a private person, I grieve privately and you guys see the smiling and laughing Eddie all the time, but there will be those moments where I'm hurting and these individuals give me a safe space to grieve. So guys, I want to thank you guys and I urge my colleagues to please take this resolution seriously. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mr.

Gibbs.

On the resolution, all those in favor signify by saying aye; opposed, no. The resolution is adopted.

(Applause)

Resolution No. 216 the Clerk will read.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. 216, Ms. Joyner.

Legislative Resolution memorializing Governor

Kathy Hochul to proclaim March 2023, as Kidney Disease Awareness Month in the State of New York.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: On the resolution, all those in favor signify by saying aye; opposed, no. The resolution is adopted.

Mrs. People-Stokes for the purposes of a

introduction.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Mr. Speaker, I think our guests from Queens have left. Thank you so much. I don't see them -yes, thank you for the opportunity, Mr. Speaker, but are guests from Queens have left.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Page 8, Calender No. 32, the Clerk will read.

THE CLERK: Bill No. A02878, Calender No. 32, Aubry, Kim, Taylor, Burgos, Reyes, Hevesi, Fahy, O'Donnell,

Mitaynes, Anderson, Mamdani, Jackson, Clark, Simon, González-Rojas, Seawright, Carroll, Gallagher, Darling, Burdick, Cruz, Epstein, Hunter, Meeks, Weprin, Kelles, L. Rosenthal, Otis, Cook, Dinowitz, Septimo, Tapia, Lunsford, Ardila, Simone, Raga, Shimsky, Alvarez, De Los Santos, Bores. An act to amend the Criminal Procedure Law, in relation to motions to vacate judgment; and to repeal certain provisions of such law relating thereto.

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Mr. Aubry, an explanation has been requested.

MR. AUBRY: Certainly. This is bill 2878. It amends Article 440 of the Criminal Procedure Law which governs post-judgment motions to provide people previously convicted of crimes the opportunity to -- for a meaningful review to assure redress for wrongful convictions including in cases where the person pled guilty. New York State ranks third in the nation in the number of wrongful convictions. Our State has also an extremely high rate of plea bargaining. Some estimate between 96 and 98 percent of felony cases in our State resolve by plea agreement, not trial. Ninety-nine percent of misdemeanors resolve the same way. People who plead guilty are the lowest rates of exoneration because of the many structural barriers. Pressure to plead guilty even to crimes they did not commit because the pretrial process has lasted so long that after waiting months or even years for the case to resolve they could wait no longer. Under the State's previous criminal discovery law, the now repealed Criminal Procedure Law Article 240, people were not

MARCH 22, 2023

entitled to see the basic evidence in their case including witness statements and police reports until the trial began. Countless numbers of people pled guilty because of the pressure to plead even in cases where the evidence may not have supported a guilty plea or they were in fact innocent. The bill increases protections for people who are actually innocent including ensuring that they are permitted under the law to submit various types of evidence of their innocence to the court and require courts to order hearings in those cases which -- with colorable claims for actual innocence. I want you to know that we've passed previously a law in which DNA evidence can be used to do that but we are now modifying that to include other kinds of actual innocence claims. The bill would permit post-conviction review of claims in cases that went to trial or those resolved by a plea. The bill removes procedural bars for people to challenge convictions based on false or faulty evidence. The bill extends new due process protections to applicants for post-conviction release, rights to access complete discovery of both the prosecution and the defense counsel's files, access to including retesting of physical evidence. The bill also expands protections for people exposed to significant collateral consequences for their convictions. The bill brings New York in line with five other states and the District of Columbia that have mechanisms for people to clear old convictions for crimes that have subsequently been decriminalized.

We have seen a number of exonerations in this State. More recently we saw exonerations in the case of the Central Park

MARCH 22, 2023

Five, we saw them in the murder convictions of Malcolm X and any other numerous cases that either new evidence was found or faulty methods in prosecution were detected and resolved. Many times that's resolved by district attorneys who have created units to review those cases. However, the number of plea bargains leaves us suspect as to whether or not we have been able to find those kinds of cases in -- in many other situations as well as whether or not it is done equally across this State. And we think that a law that will require that and will provide that kind of access to applicants should be enacted. So just two personal notes. I guess I'm still on time? Have I still got a little time left?

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Another minute.

MR. AUBRY: Another minute, okay. So two personal attachments. I tried to figure out this was a bill we passed last year I think 100 to 40- something. Why I'm carrying it. Well, of course the sponsor has left us and went and passed it last year in our House. So in my musing of, okay, what are you doing carrying this bill, you're not a lawyer. But I guess I do have a history of looking at issues of social justice and criminal justice. But even more importantly Malcolm X lived on the same block that I lived. In fact, it was the house that was bomb -- bombed if you remember that connection and I knew his family and knew his wife. And at the same time two blocks down from me as it just so happens, there was a robbery of a check cashing facility where a police officer who was

acting as security and a manager who were killed by the robbers. And in that case three men from the community were arrested and went to jail for that until it was discovered through work by independent councils that there was knowledge of another suspect that in fact turned out to be the actual committer of the crime. What happens to people when they're caught in this? They serve unimaginable amounts of time in prison trying to get themselves free proclaiming their innocence or deciding to opt out to a plea bargain in order to end the torture of being incarcerated though innocent. And so it is those kind of motivations that drive me or drove me to take this legislation and I hope that I do the former sponsor proud in carrying this legislation this year. Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Thank you, Mr. Aubry.

Mr. Morinello.

MR. MORINELLO: Thank you. Will the sponsor yield for a couple questions?

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Mr. Aubry, will you yield?

MR. AUBRY: Mr. Morinello, I will. Any question you have to ask me I'll yield to, sir.

MR. MORINELLO: Thank you very much, sir. ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: The sponsor

yields.

MR. MORINELLO: So are we to understand that

MARCH 22, 2023

this also would cover in the event someone actually was either found guilty by trial or pled guilty to a crime that actually existed at the time of the plea but subsequent to that some years later was declared, was changed, that this would also apply to the person --

MR. AUBRY: Yes, that's true.

MR. MORINELLO: -- who committed the crime while it was a crime.

MR. AUBRY: Yes, that -- that is absolutely true that is the case is used about where the sponsor -- former sponsor was particularly anxious to talk about the utility knives which were illegal at one time and then were decriminalized as well as proven to be unconstitutional for them to have been criminalized. And so it would also do that.

MR. MORINELLO: But would it also apply to any law that was changed that was never declared unconstitutional?

MR. AUBRY: If there was a change in law, yes.

MR. MORINELLO: Okay. Recently this Body,

there was a rule that you could not get off a --

MR. AUBRY: One minute. Can we -- can we --ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Colleagues, we're on debate.

MR. AUBRY: The door -- the door is the problem. Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: -- that entail both talking in the Chambers and walking in and out, if we could

restrict that a bit so the folks can hear each other. Thank you.

MR. MORINELLO: Thank you.

MR. AUBRY: Thank you.

MR. MORINELLO: Little noise out in the hall

today, that's all, so thank you.

On the bill. I'm just going to make a statement.

MR AUBRY: On the bill, sir.

MR. MORINELLO: Thank you very much.

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: It's my job right

now, Mr. Aubry.

On the bill.

MR. MORINELLO: Thank you, Mr. Sponsor. So they could hear me.

(Laughter/applause)

MR. AUBRY: Old dog, new tricks.

MR. MORINELLO: You did a great job. In New York, State Criminal Procedure Law provides many, many vehicles for those who were convicted through collusion, who were forced, who may have been incarcerated because they couldn't afford bail and many other reasons. In addition to that, prior to a judge taking a plea, there's a colloquy that he must go through and that the -- in this I will call it the applicant because that's what you've referred it to rather than the defendant. But in that case the applicant has -- this is at the time of the plea. He has counsel, he's had a chance to review and there is a complete colloquy that should the judge not go through would vacate

MARCH 22, 2023

it. And I'm referring to those crimes that actually were in existence at the time. What this one basically says is you were convicted because you broke the law. You were embroiled in a State that is increasing crime and what is happening is this: There are no one these days who want to be responsible for the consequences of their actions. That's something I was taught when I was very young. You have to be prepared. Our youth are confused. We talk about mental health but what we are doing to them, in one hand we tell them don't break the law and on the other hand we tell them it's okay, there's no consequences for you. You can get away with it, you can do this. So this bill here really and truly does not have a base in breaking the law. It does not have a basis. And you committed a crime but we're going to tell you it's okay. You know growing up I grew up as a Roman Catholic household and it was a principle that you couldn't eat meat on Friday or you would be damned to hell. That was changed some time during my younger years and the issue became one, do we ask the Lord to forgive those that broke the law prior to the change, because at the time they knew what the law was that they broke. What we have to do is recognize that we have laws and you can't break the law, nobody ever wants to just say don't break the law. It's like oh, the poor criminals, oh, these poor persons. Now -- and I'm not referring to wrongfully convicted. I'm not referring to those who were coerced. What I'm concerned with in this bill is those that have actually consciously broke the law, found guilty by trial with their peers beyond a reasonable doubt, yet we're able to give them a free

MARCH 22, 2023

pass at some point. They were in jail for a while. We should tell them it's okay to go home. You know used to be for burglary that whether you were home or not if someone broke into your home, your domain, it was the same as if you were home or not home. We have changed the law in this Body that they've now delineated they can break into your domain, invade your privacy, but it's less if you were not in that household. So I find that very disingenuous that we've already made that change and I cannot for the life of me understand why there is a differential. If they break into your home, they should -- the penalties should be the same. This is another way of saying everything's okay, you can break the law, we're going to come up with a way to exonerate you and have no responsibility for the consequences of your actions. Thank you very much and I want to thank the sponsor for his courtesy.

> ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Mr. Goodell. MR. GOODELL: Thank you, sir. On the bill.

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: On the bill.

MR. GOODELL: I appreciate my colleague's comments. And I want to talk just for a moment a little bit about some of the specifics in this bill. I suspect that maybe not all of us have thoroughly read and contemplated the 12 pages of amendments that are reflected in this bill, but I just want to touch base on some of them. Under our current Criminal Procedure Law if a defendant wants to challenge his conviction or have a court review his guilty

MARCH 22, 2023

plea he can make what's known as a 440 motion. And that brings the motion back up in front of the Appellate Division for review. And so in order to make that 440 motion, as you would expect, the motion has to be made in a timely manner. You can only make the motion once, you can't keep doing it over and over. If you've already had a ruling on that motion you can't make another motion. All those procedural commonsense rules are rejected in these amendments. So these amendments specifically say you can make this motion even though the defendant unjustifiably failed to bring up the matter early. Or it was previously ruled against him. And that's just going to slow down and clog up our judicial system and we should expect people to make a timely motion, preserve their defenses and allow these things to be reviewed in a timely manner. There's special provisions on this amendment that deal with undocumented or illegal immigrants who are arrested and convicted or plead guilty. And what these amendments say that is if that defendant who has been -- who has plead guilty and has been sentenced wants to make a 440 motion there's a presumption that their guilty plea was not knowing and voluntary. A rebuttable presumption. So if you're here illegally and you plead guilty to a Class D or E felony there's a -- a presumption that your guilty plea should be set aside. Ironically you're allowed to reduce your felony plea to a misdemeanor because we, a few years ago, reduced the maximum sentence Statewide for a misdemeanor to be 364 days instead of 365 so you wouldn't trigger deportation, because apparently New York State wants to be a safe haven for

MARCH 22, 2023

illegal immigrants who have pled guilty to misdemeanors. And we want to assume that if they plead guilty to a felony there's a rebuttable presumption that they didn't mean to because it might result in an illegal immigrant being deported for having committed a serious felony. Over and over these changes state, with few exceptions, that if the motion is granted the indictment is sealed. It's not automatically sent back for a new trial. The case is thrown out. So these are very, very wide ranging changes that deserve careful consideration. Now my colleague pointed out that in the past there was concerns about a defendant receiving information at the last minute or even at trial that would be helpful, but we addressed that situation a few years ago by requiring extensive discovery well in advance. So before we pass legislation that creates a presumption that those who pled guilty or were convicted of being guilty of a serious felony didn't do so knowingly if it would result in a deportation or before we say that you admittedly convicted -- were convicted or plead guilty of a crime and there was no defense and you're not raising a defense and you've never raised a defense that you can nevertheless walk scot-free if at any time in the future the Legislature changes the law. I think our position should be really clear. We expect all New Yorkers to comply with all the current laws. That should always be our position. The current provisions that allow a review if you preserve it, if you raise it, if you act in a reasonable manner, those are the right procedures and should remain in place. As was one of the reasons mentioned by my colleague and for the seriousness of these very broad changes, I would

MARCH 22, 2023

recommend that we not adopt this legislation. Thank you, Mr. Speaker and again, thank you to both colleagues.

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Ms. Walker. MS. WALKER: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. On the bill.

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: On the bill.

MS. WALKER: In the beautiful community of

Brooklyn, New York in Kings County there have been over 500 exonerated cases that were based on wrongful convictions. Many of them came as a result of the misconduct of police officers at many different stages of their investigation. Some of them came because young men who were standing on the basketball court enjoying a beautiful summer day were approached and offered in some instances \$10 to come and stand in at a line-up and they say *oh*, *don't worry* about it. You won't be picked out, you weren't there. We just need to have an appropriate line-up so that someone can come in and figure out who actually committed this robbery yesterday. Sometimes that decision could have been based on the fact that maybe that person was hungry that day and they really needed the \$10 and believed in their heart that justice was going to prevail and that they would be able to go home that day. Well, guess what? They were picked out in that line-up, although they were not at the scene of the crime. Although they may not even have been in the State at the time that the crime was convicted -- was committed. Even in circumstances where at trial the information about the faulty identification of individuals were

presented, the case would still proceed because yes, we have the right guy. And they spend 25 and 30 years in prison as in the case most recently of Sheldon Thomas who just so happened to have lived in the same community of another Sheldon Thomas, but his case was recently overturned. Then we have dealt with a number of circumstances here within this Chamber. For instance, bail. We know that bail sometimes is utilized as a tool for prosecutors to be able to hold someone behind bars and then they could say *I know you* want to go home today so just plead guilty to this particular case and you're going to leave. And that person never gets an opportunity to leave simply because they believed in the system and they believed that they were genuinely going to go home that day. Or we also did something great with discovery and we said a lot of times people are getting convicted at the eve of trial because their -- their -- their defense counsel was not receiving the information that may lead to them being let go at a timely fashion to be able to put forth a proper defense. And they are convicted even though they have never had an opportunity to see the evidence that was presented against them until a point where there was nothing that they could do about it. And then they try in so many different instances and they say you know what? I am not going to plead to this. I am not going to give up my -- my innocence even though I go to the parole board year, after year, after year, after year and they want me to say you know what? I did commit this crime and I feel sorry for all of the victims who were hurt as a result of my actions and they won't do it because they know in

their heart that they did not commit the underlying crime. And even that instance is still not enough for them to be able to make the motions in the past so that they can be released and be back at home with their families. Notwithstanding a dying mother or dying grandmother or dying child, wherever their circumstances are this person is still to be committed behind bars for decade, after decade, after decade. And so we are excited today that they will have an opportunity for them to be justified in their -- in their -- in their -- and dignified in them saying that I am truly and truly innocent here. And so we are asking for a judge not to just set me free, but to allow me the opportunity to provide the DNA evidence that exonerates me. Allow people the opportunity to recant their testimony so that I can go home. Allow the person who actually committed the crime who is sitting next door to me in the cell who said I was the one who committed the crime even though the District Attorney is saying that person is lying. Allow them to move forward so that I can go home and be productive citizens just like you and I without a record that will hold me back from housing, that will hold me back from employment opportunities, that will hold me back from educational experiences. And so we're just saying to give these people an opportunity to prove their innocence because again the American Dream is that we are innocent until proven guilty. And in fact, we also are in times of due process and anytime there's anything that conflicts with our amazing constitutional rights we still have to defend them at whatever the stage is no matter where the injustice took place. And so it is an honor to

MARCH 22, 2023

stand and speak on behalf of this particular bill and at the appropriate time I encourage my colleagues to, you know, look deep inside of yourselves, not just your political connections but to really just look at the thing that binds each and every one of us, humanity. And I will vote in the affirmative.

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Read the last section.

THE CLERK: This act shall take effect immediately. ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: A Party vote has been requested.

Mr. Goodell.

MR. GOODELL: Thank you, sir. The Republican Conference will generally be opposed to this. Those who support it are certainly encouraged to vote in favor here on the floor of the Assembly. Thank you, sir.

> ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Thank you. Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Thank you, Mr.

Speaker. The Majority Conference is generally going to be in favor of this piece of legislation. However there may be a few of our colleagues that would like to be an exception, they should feel free to do so.

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Thank you.

The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

Mr. Aubry to explain his vote.

MR. AUBRY: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. First of all, I want to commend my colleagues for their thoughts and concerns on this issue. I stand in support of this legislation. I want to thank the former sponsor who I hope we have held faith to his firm belief in justice and the rule of law. I also think that the one issue that we don't talk about when we talk about this is the unequal incarceration of minorities in this State and in this country and that race seems to always matter one way or another. And certainly in the cases both of plea agreements you will find by doing statistics how many more people of color are forced into plea agreements because they have been held unconscionably in some of our facilities. Time in Rikers. We know Kalief Browder and several other individuals have suffered awful consequences because accused, but not convicted, they are held and ultimately forced to confess to a crime that they may not have committed. I don't mean all, but there's certainly been enough cases for us to assume that it goes on more than it is discussed and more than it is admitted to. In this country we believe that justice is blind. And that the weighing of evidence is done in an equal fashion. But yet we know that if you have a high-priced lawyer your possibility of justice is increased exponentially. And if you are not so represented, that your opportunities for justice are diminished. So what we do here is provide an opportunity for individuals who can prove, even if they have been convicted or plead, to find an opportunity to provide justice. The bill also provides for counsel for individuals who are

incarcerated, which does not now exist for them. And we know that in the budget that is being contemplated there is dollars both for the prosecution and the defense to provide opportunities for the improvement of discovery -- discovery. In those tripartite bills that we passed in years past, my particular interest was in speedy trial because it was a Constitutional guarantee. And we know that in this State, you know, lawyers who practice, people in general, that we do not have speedy trial and that people languish in jail, in places that threatens their lives. So what I am trying to do, what the sponsor who first did this is trying to do is to open up the opportunity so that this system provides justice for all regardless of their means. I vote in the affirmative.

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Mr. Aubry in the affirmative.

Ms. Walker to explain her vote.

MS. WALKER: Thank you, Mr. -- I would like -thank you, Mr. Speaker. And I would also like to commend the sponsor for this amazing piece of legislation because we know that all too often in New York State there are people due to ineffective assistance of counsel, coerced deals and the fear of facing harsh penalties at trial or for whatever reason plead guilty to crimes that they didn't commit. Under permanent law in New York State people who plead guilty to a crime have a few avenues to challenge wrongful convictions. The State allows people to seek exonerations if there's DNA evidence that supports their claim of innocence. But if there's

MARCH 22, 2023

no DNA, the road to freedom is often blocked. Across the country at least 90 percent of all criminal convictions are a result of a plea agreement, and more to the point, the Department of Justice found that 1 in 4 people exonerated in the U.S. had initially pleaded guilty. If the system fails even one person, if someone spends one day behind bars for a crime that they didn't commit, then we might as well deny justice for all of us. I am proud to lend my voice in support of the Assemblymembers wrongful conviction bill, including a provision that would create a post-conviction right to counsel and a right to discovery after conviction. *This* is what fairness looks like. We all know people who have criminal convictions on their record face barriers in employment, housing, education and even the opportunity to learn a trade. This bill will go a long way toward clearing wrongfully convicted people and giving them a chance to be productive citizens. New York is one of few states that doesn't provide a legal mechanism for people to prove their innocence or at least have their cases reviewed. I am confident that the Wrongful Conviction Act will put us on the pathway to justice for the wrongfully convicted. Thank you and I vote in the affirmative.

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Ms. Walker in the affirmative.

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes to explain her vote.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Thank you, Mr.

Speaker, for the opportunity to explain my vote. You know, I listen really intently at these debates because you could tell a member's

experience by how they think about this piece of legislation. If you have never experienced or even know a person who was wrongfully convicted and didn't have the opportunity for regress, it's hard to understand it. Sometimes you want everything to be exactly as the law is but we know there are people who commit crimes in this country who haven't even been tried, less known convicted. So to assume that the law is always perfect, is imperfect and it's not right. And so I actually know people who were arrested, did not commit the crime, but because they would not confess to it they had the prosecutors coming to them saying don't you want to see your kids tomorrow? Of course they want to see their kids tomorrow. Of course they want to go home to their families. But they're not willing to commit to a crime that they didn't do. There are people -- men in Buffalo who were incarcerated for almost 20 years, five of them, actually two of them died in prison, wrongfully convicted. Almost decades of their life taken away because it wasn't done right. At minimum we need to be able to acknowledge that we're always not perfect, even though we would like to say no one is above the law, that's not true. Some people are above the law and some people are under it. This piece of legislation I commend the sponsor for gives people an opportunity to challenge a wrongful conviction. Not create some new news, to challenge the fact that their life has been taken from them and their families and their communities for decades. That's -- that's all this does. It's fair, it's honorable and it's what we should be doing as Americans and as New Yorkers. By the way, New

MARCH 22, 2023

York is only five states left in this nation that won't allow its citizens that opportunity so I am pleased to vote in favor of this and I honor the sponsor for introducing it.

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Mrs. Peoples-Stokes in the affirmative.

Ms. Shimsky to explain her vote.

MS. SHIMSKY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. As a former prosecutor I know that the primary value that we have to focus on and that we have to try to vindicate in our Criminal Justice System is factual guilt or factual innocence. And the 440 post-conviction process was never a perfect tool for doing that. The Supreme Court eroded constitutional protections in this regard. You know I knew there was a real bad moon rising in this country when a major newspaper in the 1990s, I remember seeing a letter to the editor saying that it was perfectly fine to execute innocent people in the -- in the name of finality of judgment. That's ethically really messed up and I am proud to be a cosponsor of this bill today.

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Ms. Shimsky in the affirmative.

Mr. Burdick to explain his vote.

MR. BURDICK: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I rise to explain my vote. If we truly believe in the rule of law, in justice and in holding dear the guarantees of the U.S. Constitution, then we have a duty to vote in favor of this bill to allow challenges and rectifications of wrongful convictions. It is the right and proper action in providing

MARCH 22, 2023

social and racial justice. It is the right and proper action in upholding our oath of office. I commend the sponsor for bringing this measure to the floor and to the Speaker for allowing it to go forward. I vote in the affirmative.

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Mr. Burdick in the affirmative.

Mr. Lavine to explain his vote.

MR. LAVINE: Thank -- thank you, Mr. Speaker. Nearly half a century ago as a public defender I represented an innocent man and we had a trial and we did everything right and he should have been acquited. He was convicted. He languished in jail and this was a guy with some emotional problems for six or seven years before an appellate court decided that he had been wronged at trial and reversed his conviction. I'm still haunted by that. We as Americans should be haunted and are haunted by injustice because after all we are a nation founded on the concept of liberty and justice for all. But I suppose a lot here depends on how we define justice. I choose to define justice from the point of view from the perspective of the individual involved as a defendant as an accused in a prosecution. Obviously some of my colleagues see justice as being painted with a much broader brush. A broader brush that assumes that everyone who was convicted is actually guilty.

Now I had over the course of my legal career ended up representing -- it was an interesting nuanced area, major federal, national and internal cooperators who were debriefed extensively by

the United States Government because their credibility meant everything. And in down moments I would ask them and I trusted them. I trusted them to tell me the truth, they had to tell the truth. How many people in jail are actually innocent? Consistently it was ten to 15 percent. Now that could be troubling, but human nature being such if the justice system functions well 85 percent of the time that's not a bad law averages, unless you're in that ten to 15 percent of the people who are in jail who are innocent. So what I want to say is this. I think this is a great bill. It addresses the concerns of the individual while still protecting the public and I would just simply end with this. In the corridor leading to the LOB there are now a bunch of historic photographs that depict well-known and famous people who have been here in the Chamber or in the LOB but primarily the Chamber. And there is a photo of Malcolm X sitting right up there, right above where the Speaker Pro Temp is sitting right now looking down. And to the sponsor I would say, if he was still there he'd be proud of you. I vote in the affirmative, thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Mr. Lavine in the affirmative.

Ms. Cruz to explain her vote.

MS. CRUZ: Thank you, Mr. Speaker, and thank you to the sponsor of this piece of legislation. You know many of us in this House are attorneys and many of us chose this job because we believe in the power of the law. And in an ideal world anyone who takes a plea or anyone who is convicted is guilty. We would like to

MARCH 22, 2023

believe that. The movies would like for us to believe that but the movies and reality are very different. Many people take pleas because it's -- they need to get out sooner because ten years ago if you had an immigration hold in 24 hours you can kiss your family and the country goodbye without even due process because you have perhaps bad advice from an attorney, because you might not understand what's happening or because you might be afraid. There's a number of reasons why that happens. And in communities like the one that Jessica and I represent where there are many immigrants documented and undocumented, people without citizenship or that have a different status will often make a decision in the best interest of their family even if that means they get deported. Because for them it's about putting their family first. And so I want to thank the sponsor because while the section that relates to how this will impact someone's ability to no longer be removable, it's a tiny little section, it means the world to thousands of New Yorkers who are documented and undocumented, who may be permanent residents, who may be DACA recipients, who may be asylum seekers and will find themselves in that position and now they actually have an opportunity to seek justice. And so for that we thank you. And before I sit I'd like to remind my colleagues in the entire State legislature that humans are not illegal. Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Ms. Cruz in the affirmative.

Mr. Taylor to explain his vote.

MR. TAYLOR: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I rise to explain my vote. I think the arguments that have been laid out quite well. I would suggest perhaps we forget about titles and just look at humanity. And if someone is wrong what are we trying to do to fix it? Even if it's just one person take the opportunity and look at that scenario and see how we can make it better, not with a presumption that this person is that group or that group or from there, but look at the humanity of it and say is this fair and is it the best thing that we can do in this situation and if it's not then we need to fix it and I vote in the affirmative. Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER ZEBROWSKI: Mr. Taylor in the affirmative.

Are there any other votes? Announce the results. (The Clerk announced the results.) The bill is passed. Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Thank you, Mr.

Speaker, for allowing me to interrupt our proceedings momentarily to introduce some guests that are in the Chambers of our colleague Rebecca Seawright and probably most other people who are in the room would be in support of these women being here. They are from the Women's Business Council. They are Christine Boccia. She is the Executive Director and manager at Traditional Industries and President of Women Builders Council. Jayne Czik is the vice-president and general counsel of Citnalta Construction Company.

Cordia Murphy is an assistant vice-president of Wrap-Up Insurance, administrative services. Elizabeth Weiss is President of A.C. [sic] McNulty Company, Incorporated and Sandra Wilkin is the founder and the President of Bradford Construction Corporation. Mr. Speaker, would you please welcome these amazing women to our Chambers and offer them the cordialities of our House.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Certainly. On behalf of Mrs. Crys -- -- Crystal People-Stokes, on behalf of Ms. Seawright, the Speaker and all the members, we welcome this amazing group of powerful women here to the New York State Assembly. We extend to you the privileges of the floor. Hope that you have enjoyed the debate that we engaged in and have learned a bit about our process as we celebrate the success that you have provided both yourselves, your companies and the State of New York. Thank you so very much for being here.

(Applause)

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes for the purposes of --

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Mr. Speaker, members have on their desks an A-Calendar. I'd like to advance that A-Calendar.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: On Mrs.

Peoples-Stokes' motion the A-Calendar is advanced.

Page 3, Rules Report No. 110, the Clerk will read.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. 01060-A, Rules Report

No. 110, Paulin, Thiele, Cook, Rivera, Seawright, Dinowitz, Bichotte

Hermelyn, Barrett, Kelles, Hevesi, González-Rojas, Sillitti, Dickens, Reyes, Mamdani, Rozic, Epstein, Jackson, Steck, L. Rosenthal, Carroll, Burdick, Simon, Burgos, Lunsford, Gallagher, Lavine, Clark, Glick, Otis, McDonald, Raga, McMahon. An act to amend the Education Law and the Public Health Law, in relation to the dispensing of self-administered hormonal contraceptives.

> ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The bill is laid aside. THE CLERK: Assembly No. A01395-B, Rules

Report No. 111, Epstein, Dinowitz, Jacobson, González-Rojas, Cruz, Seawright, Forrest, Reyes, Burdick, Paulin, Burgos, Simon, Hyndman, Kelles, Raga, Mamdani, Thiele, Lunsford, Dickens, De Los Santos, Gibbs. An act to amend the Education Law, in relation to providing access to medication abortion prescription drugs at the State University of New York and the City University of New York.

> ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The bill is laid aside. THE CLERK: Assembly No. A03172-A, Rules

Report No. 112, Zebrowski, Gunther, Bronson, Weprin, Steck, Hunter, Stirpe, Wallace, Ra, Durso. An act to amend the Insurance Law, in relation to inspections of private passenger automobiles prior to the provision of coverage for physical damage thereto; and providing for the repeal of such provisions upon expiration thereof.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The bill is laid aside.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A05519, Rules Report No. 113, Hunter. An act to amend the Banking Law, in relation to authorizing the department of financial services to promulgate

MARCH 22, 2023

regulations relating to the payment of debit and credit transactions and imposition of related fees by banking organizations.

> ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The bill is laid aside, Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Thank you, Mr.

Speaker. We're now going to move to a section of our today's floor activity that deals with some rule changes that our Minority colleagues would like to make. I would be remiss if I didn't make some comments early on, I'm not going to speak on every one of them because I want to say there are ten of them that they would like to introduce to amend our Assembly rules. Most of these proposals are not new, we've seen them before. And we have rejected them in the past. Although some of them we've accepted and you can see some results of that in our committee meetings as of now. However, colleagues under the leadership of Speaker Heastie we should remember that we work with both sides of the aisle. And we made some great progress and we look forward to making further great progress. We have adopted some significant rule changes of late to work on improving the efficiency and effectiveness of this House. I believe that our efforts over the years have done a great deal to open up the legislative process making it more accessible, transparent and understandable to the public. Mr. Speaker, these changes that are being offered today do not reflect the bipartisan collaboration which is often called for. These proposals before us shift the balance to Minority rule, a change with which I respectfully disagree, as do the

voters of the State of New York. Majority rule is fundamental to our way of governing as it is the respect for and the protection of Minority rights. That respect won't have me calling for lay asides because I respect their opinion and I'm willing to hear it, I hope we all are. With that said, Mr. Speaker, I urge the defeat of these proposals, but I look forward to continuing to work with all members as we modernize and improve our proceedings. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

Mr. Goodell.

MR. GOODELL: Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker, for the opportunity to address the Legislature here on a number of suggested rule changes which we believe will improve our operations and the results that we achieve as a bipartisan group. And I know it's somewhat unusual to start out with all of our proposals being criticized before we've even explained them. And I appreciate the commitment to continue to work with the Minority. I just wish it would extend to listening to the Minority before we present our suggestions. As my colleague correctly noted, the Legislature works best when we work in a bipartisan way that listens to different views and welcomes new ideas and we have some new ideas and some ideas that we're still hoping to convince the Majority are worthwhile pursuing. In that context, Mr. Speaker, I offer the following resolution and request the opportunity to briefly explain it.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will read.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. 217, Mr. Barclay. Assembly Resolution amending Section 7 of Rule 3 of the Assembly rules in relating to the reading of bills.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Goodell on the resolution.

MR. GOODELL: Thank you, sir. This resolution would amend our bills to require a two-thirds vote to accept a Message of Necessity. Now before anyone in the Majority gets too worried, I want to assure you that you in the Majority have a two-thirds vote. So all this motion does is say to our friends and colleagues in the Majority that two-thirds of you or us in the whole should sign off on a motion or to consider a bill under a Message of Necessity. Now why is this important? Our State Constitution provides that before we as a Legislature act on any bill it should be available to us for at least three days so that we can read it and analyze it and discuss it and get input from our constituents and from the public. Three days is what our Constitution requires. It's not three weeks or three months, just simply three days to make sure that we're operating in a thoughtful, deliberate manner. Now the State Constitution recognizes that there may be extraordinary circumstances where there's an emergency and we can't wait three days. So the Constitution allows the Governor to ask the Legislature act without even three days notice with a Statement of Necessity, an emergency statement, if you will. The problem is that that emergency Statement of Necessity has become the normal practice whenever we're dealing

MARCH 22, 2023

with bills that are not an emergency but are complex or controversial or have political significance. Now think about that for a minute. The very bills that we should be taking our time on and analyzing and reaching out for advice and talking to our constituents and holding hearings on, if necessary, are the very bills that routinely have a statement of necessity and ask us to act on short notice. As a simple example, last year nine of the ten budget bills were all passed with a Statement of Necessity, nine out of ten. And these budget bills, as you know, can range up to 1,000 pages and deal with some of the most important and momentous issues that we, as legislators, are called upon to vote. And we have in this legislative Chamber voted on complex budget bills while the printing copy -- printed copy was still warm from the printer. That, my friends, is a disservice to all of our constituents and to the residents of the State of New York. We should operate in a careful, thoughtful, open, deliberate manner on the most important issues facing us. And if there's a true emergency, I have no doubt whatsoever that whether they wish to do it on their own with their two-thirds Majority as the Democrat caucus already has or whether we want to do it on a bipartisan basis, we can accept the Message of Necessity. This rule change gives each of us a voice in whether or not we have enough time to carefully and thoughtfully evaluate and rule on a particular piece of legislation and whether or not it's a true emergency or merely expedient politically to avoid the openness and transparency and the input that we all seek to obtain. So I'm looking forward to this resolution that calls for a two-thirds

MARCH 22, 2023

approval of a Message of Necessity, which I remind my colleagues can be accomplished just by the Democratic caucus alone. I look forward to all of you supporting that commonsense proposal. Thank you, sir.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mr. Goodell.

A Party vote has been requested.

Mr. Goodell.

MR. GOODELL: I am sure the Democratic party wants to join the Republicans voting in favor of this, but I'll let Mrs. Peoples-Stok -- Stoke -- the Majority Leader speak for her conference. Our conference is enthusiastic on this. Thank you, sir.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you.

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Thank you, Andy Goodell. It is my pleasure to speak on behalf of the Majority Conference and recommend that we will not be supporting this resolution. Obviously some of our colleagues who feel like they need to be an exception certainly have that -- will be given that consideration.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

The Clerk will record the vote. (The Clerk recorded the vote.) Are there any other votes? Announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.) The bill is -- the resolution is defeated. Mr. Slater. MR. SLATER: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I offer the following resolution and request the opportunity to briefly explain it. ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Certainly. The Clerk will read.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. 218, Mr. Barclay. Assembly Resolution amending Section 6 of Rule 5 of the Assembly rules in relation to the length of debate on bills.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Slater on the resolution.

MR. SLATER: On the resolution, thank you, Mr. Speaker. This amendment to the rules would restore uncapped debate for any budget bill which we hope to see next week. The bill is passed with a Message of Necessity or resolution amending the rules of the Assembly and it protects the ability for all members of this House to speak for up to 30 minutes on the same. Just last year with strong opposition from members of the Assembly Minority Conference, this House adopted a resolution that limited the amount of time for all floor debates. Less than three months later this same House passed a late State budget which was negotiated behind closed doors, passed in the dead of night with little public awareness and as Mr. Goodell pointed out required a Message of Necessity for nine out of the ten bills. Debate on this floor is often the first time that the

details of enacted budgets or other significant bills are discussed in a public setting. As a new member of this legislative Body I can attest to the fact that I find the debates to be informative, being educated, learning of different perspectives and views to help make a sound decision. This amendment to the rules is necessary to ensure a robust and open debate which is essential to preserving our democracy, helping our members make more informed votes and keeping our constituents aware of their State government. By voting for this resolution we will honor the concerns and voices of all of our constituents by restoring our ability to debate important matters before this House that effect the lives of nearly 20 million New Yorkers and again, Mr. Speaker, I say also allow us to educate each other and provide that extra level of transparency that all New Yorkers deserve. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

> ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, sir. Party vote has been requested.

Mr. Goodell.

MR. GOODELL: Thank you, sir. The Republican Conference generally supports this rule change. Those who oppose it can certainly vote no on the floor of the Assembly. Thank you, sir.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you.

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Thank you, Mr.

Speaker. The Majority Conference will be voting against this change. We thought we did the right thing the last time so hopefully we will

MARCH 22, 2023

do the right thing again today. Thank you, sir.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)
Are there any other votes? Announce the results.
(The Clerk announced the results.)
Resolution is lost.
Mr. Maher.
MR. MAHER: Mr. Speaker, I offer the following
resolution and request the opportunity to briefly explain it.
ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will read.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. 219, Mr. Barclay.

Assembly Resolution amending Section 2 of Rule 4 of the Assembly rules in relation to the broadcast of committee meetings.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Maher on the resolution.

MR. MAHER: Thank you, sir. This amendment to the rules would require the archiving of committee meetings on the Assembly website. As many of us know in March of 2016 through a bipartisan effort, the members of this House made a step in the right direction when we voted to bring transparency to the committee process by requiring the broadcast of committees on the Assembly website when practical. We are pleased that this reform was finally implemented this year, seven years after its adoption. However one more step is necessary to ensure full transparency of committee

meetings. Currently committee meetings are livestreamed but unlike our Session proceedings the recordings are not archived on the Assembly website. Thus, constituents who missed the livestream are unable to watch their elected Assemblymembers vote in committee even though the ability to archive those meetings on the Assembly website is available. Our colleagues in the Senate archive their committee meetings. Now it is time for the House to do the same. This amendment to the rules is necessary to ensure that all New Yorkers have the ability to witness the proceedings of their representatives in the People's House in all its forms. As we all know the work of our standing committees is extremely important in the same manner that our proceedings on the floor are recorded and archived for public broadcast. So, too, should the activities of our committees. And I just want to also note that in 2019 this House established a very important piece of legislation that forced our IDAs throughout the State of New York, over 100 IDAs, not just to publicly record their meetings, but also to archive them. And that was important because as a town supervisor later that year in 2020, I was able to utilize this to also make sure our town board meetings, planning board meetings and their work sessions were not only livestreamed but also archived. And we can't just be for transparency when the timing is okay for us when we are in Session. It's important to always be able to be transport -- transparent to the people. So when they're at work and they can't be here to watch Session or watch committees live, we should be able to allow them the opportunity to

watch them at their own convenience so that they can take part in this process that we all work so hard to maximize our work to the people that we represent. So I'm hoping that this Body will stay consistent to our beliefs in 2019. We were right then, you all were right then, and I'm hoping that you'll join me in supporting this. Thank you, sir.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you.

Party vote has been requested.

Mr. Goodell.

MR. GOODELL: Thank you, sir. The Republican Conference is generally in support of this resolution for the reasons mentioned by my colleague. Those who do not support it are certainly free to vote no here on the floor of the Assembly. Thank you.

> ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, sir. Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Thank you, Mr.

Speaker. The Majority Conference generally going to vote against this one. As was stated by my colleague on the other side of the aisle this got started in '16 and finally happened. And I believe at some point the remainder will happen as well but it's not today. So we'll be voting in the negative. However, there may be some of our colleagues who desire to be an exception and that is quite possible, sir. Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mrs.

Peoples-Stokes.

The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)
Are there any other votes? Announce the results.
(The Clerk announced the results.)
The resolution is lost.
Mr. Ra, why do you rise?
MR. RA: Mr. Speaker, point of order.
ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: And your point?
MR. RA: My point is that under Rule 3, Section F of

our rules states: All resolutions shall be adopted by a majority vote of the members present and voting. Now, as you know earlier this year, we also adopted a rules changes to allow for fast roll calls which states that members shall be recorded in the affirmative unless they enter a negative vote through the electronic voting system. So it's my belief that given the number of members I currently see in the Chamber that our resolution should have been passed by the number of members actually present in this Chamber at the time of those votes. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: And so, as you know, we count individuals who have been counted present because they've checked in. And if you are looking for a slow roll call you have every right to call a slow roll call if you want to change that manner of voting.

MR. RA: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Perhaps we'll have further discussion on this on the next few rules changes that we're offering. But I do want to again point out when we had this

discussion about empty seat voting earlier in this Session, you know, one of the things that was assured to us was that everybody would always be in the Chamber present voting and there have been times during the voting on several of these resolutions where I saw parts of the Chamber that somebody could've pretty much swung a ten foot pole around without hitting another individual. So, thank you Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mr. Ra. Your point is not well-taken.

(Laugher)

Mr. Tague for the purposes of offering a resolution,

please.

MR. TAGUE: Mr. Speaker, first of all, I just want to say it was so nice to see all those red lights up there the last couple of votes. But, Mr. Speaker, I offer the following resolution and request the opportunity to explain it.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will read.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. 220, Mr. Barclay.

Assembly Resolution amending Section 4 of Rule 4 of the Assembly rules in relation to public hearings.

MR. TAGUE: On the resolution, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Tague on the resolution, proceed.

MR. TAGUE: This amendment to the rules would allow for committee hearing petitions by requiring that a committee

chairperson call a public hearing upon a petition signed by one-third of the members of the committee. At a time of much-needed governmental reform, we must provide the public greater access to our committee process and finally bring about the meaningful changes desired by all New Yorkers. For those of us who support the cause of good government and enhance transparency, it is important to do all we can to increase respect for this House and all those who serve in it. The first step to accomplish this goal is by improving a process for members of a committee to call for a public hearing.

For example, Mr. Speaker, two years ago a report was issued by Attorney General James confirming a number of alarming suspicions about the Cuomo administration's management and willful lack of transparency regarding nursing home deaths. As a result, Mr. Speaker, members of this House repeatedly called for public hearings for our aging, health and oversight committees to subpoena the former Health Commissioner and members of the Cuomo Administration to demand answers. However, Mr. Speaker, those repeated efforts were consistently denied. Regardless of which conference members belonged to, all legislators' thoughts and concerns regarding the issues effecting their constituents have equal merit. Undoubtedly, we all benefit from learning more as a result of open public hearings on controversial, complex legislation or issues. Mr. Speaker, this amendment to the rules is necessary to further empower committee members to call for public hearings should they feel that important matters must be addressed or get public input on

pending legislation. By bringing greater openness to the legislative process through public hearings, we will be giving every single New Yorker an opportunity to have their voice heard. My fellow colleagues, I urge your support of this important resolution. Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mr. Tague.

A Party vote has been requested.

Mr. Goodell.

MR. GOODELL: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. The Republican Conference supports this rule change in general. If there's anyone who opposes it they can certainly vote no here on the floor of the Assembly. Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you.

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Thank you, Mr.

Speaker. The Majority Conference does not support this offer of this amendment and we will look forward to voting it down. Thank you, sir.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, ma'am.The Clerk will record the vote.(The Clerk recorded the vote.)Are there any other votes? Announce the results.(The Clerk announced the results.)Resolution is lost.

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Thank you, Mr.

Speaker, for allowing me to interrupt our proceedings for the purposes of introducing some guests that are in the Chambers on behalf of our colleagues Ms. Dickens, Mr. Taylor, Ms. Bichotte-Hermelyn and Mr. Vanel. We have with us this afternoon Chief Diversity Officer for the Great City of New York Michael Garner. If you would please welcome him to our Chambers and offer him the cordialities of the House it would be very appreciative. Thank you, sir.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Certainly. On behalf of Mrs. Peoples-Stokes, Ms. Dickens, all of the members gathered around you, you can gather them around you certainly. We extend to you the privileges of the floor, welcome you here today. Thank you for the work that you're doing for increasing the opportunities for MWBEs to participate in the economic growth that is necessary in this State. It is beneficial to all communities when we have that kind of diversity and growth. Thank you for those opportunities, thanks for your work, for years of work, quite frankly. I know you well. Thank you, sir.

(Applause)

Ms. Walsh for the purposes of a resolution.

MS. WALSH: Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker. I offer the following resolution and request the opportunity to briefly explain it.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will read.

MARCH 22, 2023

THE CLERK: Assembly No. 221, Mr. Barclay. Assembly Resolution amending Section 7 of Rule 4 of the Assembly rules in relation to committees.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Ms. Walsh on the resolution.

MS. WALSH: Yes, thank you, Mr. Speaker. So this resolution which we finally refer to as the Spirit of '76 has been introduced in this Chamber it feels since 1776. It has been around for a long time and that should not indicate to any of you that it does not have any merit, I think it really does. Basically what it says is that if there are enough people who have filled out their slips, who are sponsoring or cosponsoring or multi-sponsoring a piece of legislation wherever it emanates from, whether it comes from our side of the aisle or your side of the aisle, once it gets to 76 sponsors it should come to the floor. There should be a Motion to Discharge and it should come to the floor. I would -- I've often said that I would love to be a fly on the wall in the Majority's Conference but only because I could then fly away and you guys are still stuck sitting there for hours and hours and hours but it's my understanding anyway, that within the operations of the Majority you have a similar type of rule where a bill or a measure has got to have a certain amount of weight of approval within your conference in order for it to come to the floor. That's basically what we're saying here. We know we need 76 votes to pass a piece of legislation. If we have that many sponsors, then it's a bill that's got merit that ought to come to the floor regardless of whose name is on it

or who wrote it to begin with. That would -- that would really accomplish a couple of things. I think one of the things it would accomplish is it would make sure that all good ideas can come to the floor for a vote. I mean isn't that kind of why we're all here? I think that that's why I'm here. It would also increase member involvement. And it would really take away what -- kind of the way that we have to do things now, which is a way to operate. I just don't think it's the best way. It requires us on our side of the aisle to -- to reach out and in addition to getting those gold slips and other colored slips filled out by members on both sides of the aisle, we actually have to find somebody to carry our bills for us and that's a pretty inefficient way to operate. We -- we are operating that way. We do it, but wouldn't it be so much better, couldn't we get so much good work done if we had something like the Spirit of '76 and this resolution passed? So I would recommend it to all of my colleagues. I think its time has come and I will proudly support it and I do hope that my -- my colleagues will as well. Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Ms. Walsh.

Party vote has been called for.

Mr. Goodell.

MR. GOODELL: Thank you, sir. The Republican Conference supports the Spirit of '76, this resolution. Those who are opposed should certainly vote no here on the floor of the Assembly. Thank you, sir.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you. Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. The Majority Conference will not be in favor of this amendment so likewise we will be voting in the negative.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

The Clerk will record the vote. (The Clerk recorded the vote.) Are there any other votes? Announce the results. (The Clerk announced the results.) Resolution is lost. Mr. Hawley.

MR. HAWLEY: Well, thank you, Mr. Speaker. I'm hoping that my colleagues on the other side of the aisle will break with tradition and vote along with this resolution and request that I'm going to put before you in the opportunity to briefly explain it.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will read.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. 222, Mr. Barclay.

Assembly Resolution amending Section 7 of Rule 5 of the Assembly rules in relation to requiring the Assembly to be convened upon the submission of a petition signed by 76 members of the Assembly.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Hawley on the resolution.

MR. HAWLEY: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. This

MARCH 22, 2023

amendment to the rules would establish an actual petition process for a minimum of 76 members to call the Assembly back to Session to address specific issues. There are times when events occur as we've experienced over the last number of years when our State should require the legislative Body to reconvene to help safeguard the interests of all of our residents throughout the State of New York. Our responsibility does not conclude after we're done in June. In order to ensure that matters too compelling and too urgent do not have to wait until January, there needs to be a specific mechanism for this Body to utilize, to call an actual legislative Session. Whether it's an uptick in violent crime plaguing in our communities as we see today, an overreach of Executive authority which we've seen, emergency storm recovery issues or any other severe crisis impacting our State, this House should have a system within which to trigger actual action. This amendment to the rules is absolutely necessary to create a process by which a majority of our members, all 150 of the Assembly, can petition the Speaker to call back the Body to Session for consideration of all compelling reasons outlined in the petition. By supporting this resolution we will be providing checks and balances to our State government while also giving the public greater confidence in all of us knowing that when a big issue hits, their elected officials stand ready to act on their behalf. Mr. Speaker, I appreciate the opportunity, and thank you Majority members for supporting this.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, sir. A Party vote has been requested.

Ms. Walsh.

MS. WALSH: Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker.

Our Conference will be supportive of this resolution and we would, of course, encourage our colleagues across the aisle to be as well, but it will be a Party vote in the affirmative. Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Ms. Walsh.

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Thank you, Mr.

Speaker. Majority Conference is going to be against this change in our rules and we will be voting appropriately.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you. The Clerk will record the vote. (The Clerk recorded the vote.) Are there any other votes? Announce the results. (The Clerk announced the results.) Resolution is lost. Mr. Ra. MR. RA: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I offer the following resolution and request the opportunity to briefly explain it. ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Clerk will read. THE CLERK: Assembly No. 223, Mr. Barclay.

Assembly Resolution amending Section 3 of Rule 1 of the Assembly rules in relation to the news media access to the Assembly Chamber.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Ra on the

MARCH 22, 2023

resolution.

MR. RA: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. This amendment to the rules would allow all representatives of the news media admission to the floor of the House and areas around the Assembly Chamber during Session. To quote the Journalist Walter Cronkite, "Freedom of the press is not just important to democracy, it is democracy." This amendment to the rules is necessary to ensure that all reporters have equal access to the Assembly Chamber and its members regardless of what news outlet they work for. We're doing the People's work in the People's House and maintaining an open line of communication with members of the media is an important component of this job. Let's face it, there are plenty of closed door meetings and backroom negotiations in this building that even elected members of this Body are denied access to. But there should be absolutely no confusion, no conflicting set of guidelines and no ambiguity about where members of the press are allowed in the State Capitol. They serve as the eyes and ears of the people who elected us to this Body. And as many of us know, during the last several years during the COVID restrictions, there were restrictions on really everybody coming and going into the Chamber. But with our Chamber having opened back up, the Capitol back open to the public, there's no reason why we shouldn't restore full access to the Assembly Chamber to the members of the press. It may not always be convenient but they are the ones that keep us honest, they are the ones that make sure our constituents know what is going on at this Capitol

MARCH 22, 2023

and force us to really answer the tough questions about what's going on. So I urge my colleagues to adopt this rules change. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

> ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, sir. Party vote has been requested.

Mr. Goodell.

MR. GOODELL: Thank you, sir. The Republican Conference supports this rule change, but if there's any member that doesn't, they can vote against it and it will be duly covered by the Press. Thank you, sir.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: They're welcome to

record me, Mr. Speaker. Yearly when we start our Session we do rule changes and one of the things we always do is allow the press in the Chambers and so I believe that our Conference is going to reject this amendment. The press is welcome in our Chambers but they have to make an appointment to speak to me.

(Laughter)

So we're going to -- our colleagues will vote in the negative on this one.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

The Clerk will record the vote. (The Clerk recorded the vote.) Are there any other votes? Announce the results. (The Clerk announced the results.)

The resolution is lost.

Mr. Keith Brown.

MR. K. BROWN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I offer the following resolution and request the opportunity to explain it briefly.

> ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Clerk will read. THE CLERK: Assembly No. 224, Mr. Barclay.

Assembly Resolution amending Section 2 of Rule 4 of the Assembly rules in relation to the committee agendas.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Brown on the resolution.

MR. K. BROWN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker, for the opportunity to speak. This amendment to the rules would prohibit any bill from being removed from the committee agenda once voting on the bill has started. It would also require committee roll calls to be provided to the ranking Minority member. The committee process is a vital part of the business of the Assembly. Committee members play an integral role by reviewing, debating and voting on bills in their respective committees. However, this important committee work is sometimes obstructed when a vote does not go as planned. There has been instances where a vote does not go as planned, the Chair will pull the bill from the agenda instead of recording the vote as it occurs. The debate and the vote on the floor are thereby erased from existence. Only those who watch the committee meeting live will

know what happened as there is no public record of it. Consequently, the public will never know how its representative voted on an important bill in committee. In 2006 this House took an important step towards transparency by reforming the Assembly rules to require that committee votes be posted electronically. Now I urge this House to take the next step and require that all committee votes be recorded regardless of whether the outcome was different than intended. Thank you for the opportunity to speak.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, sir.

A Party vote has been requested.

Mr. Goodell.

MR. GOODELL: Thank you, sir. The Republican Conference would like to be recorded on this vote in the affirmative, but those who don't support it can vote no at their seat. Thank you, sir.

> ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mrs. Peoples-Stokes. MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Thank you, Mr.

Speaker. The Majority Conference will be voting in the negative on this one.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you.

The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

Are there any other votes? Announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.)

Resolution is lost.

Mr. Ari Brown.

MR. A. BROWN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I offer the following resolution and request the opportunity to briefly explain it.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will read. THE CLERK: Assembly No. 225, Mr. Barclay. Assembly Resolution amending Section 2 of Rule 3 of the Assembly rules in relation to the timely bill introduction.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Brown on the resolution.

MR. A. BROWN: Thank you. This amendment to the rules would provide for timely introduction by requiring all bills to be assigned a bill number within five business days after being delivered to the index clerk. At times, members are finding that it may take several weeks to have numbers assigned to their bills especially during the summer and fall months after the close of the Assembly Session, but also during the regularly scheduled Session months. While the Assembly Session may conclude in June, our work representing our district continues. As many of us know great bill ideas often originate from conversation with constituents or in response to events happening across the State. Such conversations at events continue to occur year-round beyond -- beyond the close of the scheduled Session. This amendment to the rules is necessary because requiring timely bill introduction during both scheduled Session and throughout the calendar years will provide greater efficiency to our

MARCH 22, 2023

legislative process. By voting for this resolution we will create a more operational and efficient legislative process for all of our members and the constituents they serve. Colleagues, this is a very simply just housekeeping, there's no reason to vote it down. Majority Leader, let's do one of these things, it's strictly housekeeping. I ask everybody to vote in the affirmative on this one. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, sir.
Mr. -Party vote has been requested.
Mr. Goodell.
MR. GOODELL: Thank you, sir. The Republican

Conference supports this timely resolution and we'll be voting in favor of it. If there's anyone that oppose it they can certainly vote no here on the floor. Thank you, sir.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you.

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Thank you, Mr.

Speaker. All due respect to my colleague, Majority Conference will be voting in the negative on this amendment.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you.

The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

Are there any other votes? Announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.)

Resolution is lost.

Mr. Durso.

MR. DURSO: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. This is the

one.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Number ten is a charm.

MR. DURSO: This is the one you've been waiting for.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Nothing, no doubt about it, Mr. Durso.

MR. DURSO: Mr. Speaker, I offer the following resolution and request the opportunity to briefly explain it.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Clerk will read. THE CLERK: Assembly No. 226, Mr. Barclay.

Assembly Resolution amending Section 2 of Rule 5 of the Assembly rules in relation to ensuring that each member is entitled to at least one substantive piece of legislation discharged from the committee and brought to a vote during each two-year term.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Durso on the resolution.

MR. DURSO: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. This amendment to the Rules creates the member's prerogative by which each member during a two-year term would be entitled to have at least one bill of his or her choosing brought to the floor for a vote. All Home Rule legislation would be excluded. There's often great difficulty encountered by members of this Body, on both sides of the

MARCH 22, 2023

aisle, in attempting to even bring one single piece of legislation to the floor for a vote, and that's simply unacceptable. While this legislation seeks to bypass all other rules regarding processing of bills in committee and going to the floor, it allows for greater reform that will benefit all the people of this State. Understandably there will be need to be a parliamentarian procedure in place to ensure a smooth and orderly flow of the legislation each of us proposes. However, when these procedures are manipulated to prevent the debate of even one bill that you, a duly-elected representative, hold in high importance than this necessitates a change to these current Rules. Many of these bills contain good ideas that could pass into law if they're only given the opportunity to be heard by the full Assembly Body. This amendment to the Rules is necessary and represents real reform that will give all our constituents equal representation across this State. By joining me in voting for this resolution you're not only asking for more than anything than which you are already entitled to as an elected official of this House, and you will bring a measure of fairness and democracy back to this Chamber.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mr. Durso. Well done.

Party vote has been requested.

Mr. Goodell.

MR. GOODELL: Thank you, sir. As my colleague mentioned, this is your last opportunity for everyone to vote yes, even

MARCH 22, 2023

if it's your sole vote yes. The Republican Conference certainly will be voting in support and we encourage our Democrat colleagues to join us as well. Thank you, sir.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mr. Goodell.

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Thank you so much, Mr. Speaker. I appreciate the cordiality of my colleagues on the other side of the aisle, but the Majority Conference is going to reject this resolution as well.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

Are there any other votes? Announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.)

Mr. Durso, similar to Mike Trout, you swung but you

missed. The resolution is lost.

Mr. Goodell.

MR. GOODELL: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Would

you call on Mr. Norris for an important announcement?

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Norris for the purposes of a announcement.

MR. NORRIS: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. There will be a Republican Conference today at 4:40 via Zoom. Republican

MARCH 22, 2023

Conference 4:40 via Zoom.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: 4:40 via Zoom.

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes, they were a little in advance but we'll allow that, proceed.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Do you have any resolutions or further housekeeping?

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Like Mike Trout we swung and we missed. There's no resolutions, no housekeeping.

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Then I move that the Assembly stand adjourned until 10:00 a.m. Thursday, March the 23rd, tomorrow being a Session day.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The House stands adjourned.

(Whereupon, at 4:25 p.m. the Assembly stood adjourned until Thursday, March 23rd at 10:00 a.m., Thursday being a Session day.)