

MONDAY, MAY 6, 2024

2:59 P.M.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The House will come to order.

In the absence of clergy, let us pause for a moment of silence.

(Whereupon, a moment of silence was observed.)

Visitors are invited to join the members in the Pledge of Allegiance.

(Whereupon, Acting Speaker Aubry led visitors and members in the Pledge of Allegiance.)

A quorum being present, the Clerk will read the Journal of Friday, May the 3rd.

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Mr. Speaker, I move to dispense with the further reading of the Journal of Friday, May the 3rd

and that the same stand approved.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Without objection, so ordered.

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Thank you, sir. I'd like to share a quote today. This one is from Thomas Edison. Need not tell folks who he is, most people know who Thomas Edison is and was. His words for us today, "Our greatest weakness lies in giving up. The most certain way to succeed is always to try just one more time." Again, the words from Thomas Edison.

Mr. Speaker, members have on their desks a main Calendar with 19 new bills. We also have a debate list, and after you have done any housekeeping and/or introduce -- housekeeping, we are going to go right to page 3 for Calendar resolutions of which we do have a few members that are going to speak. Afterwards we will consent the 19 new bills beginning with Calendar No. 422 on page 5 and gonna go straight through to Calendar No. 440. We're gonna take up the following bills on debate: Calendar No. 93 by Mr. Carroll, Rules Report No. 18 by Mr. Dinowitz, Calendar No. 232 by Ms. Paulin, Calendar No. 312 by Ms. Paulin, and Calendar No. 379 by Mr. Weprin. I will announce if there's any further floor activity we need to take care of today, Mr. Speaker.

So with that, that's the general outline of where we are today. If you have introductions or housekeeping, now would be an appropriate time, sir.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: We do have some housekeeping, Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

On a motion by Ms. Rosenthal, page 10, Calendar No. 3, Bill A.00048-B, the amendments are received and adopted.

On a motion by Ms. Rosenthal, page 12, Calendar No. 21, Bill No. A00517, amendments are received and adopted.

For the purposes of a introduction, Ms. Stilletti [sic].

MS. SILLITTI: All right. Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I'm here today with two very special guests, but I think one of them is a little bit more special than the other one. No offense. So, I've been away from Albany for a few months, but now I'm back with my son William Benedetto Clemency -- no relation to Mr. Benedetto, but it'll help me get some education aid, you know, whatever -- and this little one was a long time coming. Many, many years of trying and failing and heartache and giving up and then starting over and, you know, we were just like, *Eh, let's try one more time, see what happens*. Well, this is what happened and we're so grateful and so happy to be here.

(Applause)

Thank you. And if you can give him the privileges of the floor. He's awake now.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: On behalf of your mother and father --

MS. SILLITTI: By the way, and this is my husband Kevin Clemency.

(Laughter)

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: We thought he had something to do with this, right.

On behalf of your mother and father, the Speaker and all the members, William, we welcome you to the New York State Assembly. We extend to you the privileges of the floor. As a family member you will always be a member, and we are delighted that you're with us today. Congratulations.

(Applause)

Mr. Jones for the purpose of a introduction.

MR. JONES: Mr. Speaker, it's a pleasure to introduce a gentleman I have here in the Chambers. It's Adirondack Day here in the New York State Capitol. You can applaud that, yes.

(Applause)

There are many people here sharing the story of the Adirondacks, so if you get a chance we're a having reception 4 to 6 -- I won't get into that -- in The Well. But we have a gentleman here by the name of Mr. Jim McKenna. Jim is currently the Co-Chair of the North Country Economic Development Council, and has been recognized Statewide as a top economic developer. His initiatives and promotion in marketing tourism of the Adirondacks are unparalleled. He was also instrumental in bringing the 2023 World University Games to the North Country, and continues promoting and marketing our Olympic legacy venues. Now, Mr. McKenna will be retiring as the CEO and President of ROOST, the Regional Office of Sustainable Tourism. This being his crowning achievement, turning ROOST into

what it is today a powerhouse organization in the tourism marketing field throughout the country and beyond. When I think of top influencers in our State for sport, tourism, economic growth, Jim McKenna certainly is at the top of that list.

Now Mr. Speaker, Jim is not a fan of the word "retirement." But we also know that his work will continue in the Adirondacks and throughout, and we certainly want to recognize him for all of his deeds and all of his good works here today. On behalf of Members Smullen and Simpson, would you please extend Mr. McKenna the cordialities of the People's House and extend to him all the due gratitude that he deserves?

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Certainly. On behalf of Mr. Jones, the Speaker and all the members, Jim, we welcome you here to the New York State Assembly. We congratulate you on the years of service that you've provided to the Adirondacks, but also to the State and all of the people in it -- in the State. We hope that your retirement, well deserved, is full of enjoyment and happiness and that you will understand that you have been a significant player in the development of this State's economic base. Thank you so very much, sir. We welcome you here.

(Applause)

Mr. Dais.

MR. DAIS: Mr. Speaker -- sorry, Mr. Speaker, please, I have some amazing guests here today and I would like to introduce the Yankasa Organization [sic]. The Yankasa Organization

[sic] has been serving my community for over 40 years. The majority of their community is from Ghana, but what they have done just similar to many of us who immigrated from some country or location, created a tapestry of community to ensure that their members had a place to stay, a place to worship, a place to go to school, food in their stomachs. No different from that first delegation from Sweden or Italy or Ireland, it was an organization that set roots right here in the Capitol one day. I bring the Yankasa here because I want to let them know in my community they are seen for the tremendous work that they do. It does not matter about your religious belief, they help all of those in my community. Specifically, I do want to thank the President of the Yankasa Organization [sic], Brother Ibrahim Abdullahi Masigan; Vice President Bashir Kabore; the PR Brother Ibrahim Ahmed; Alhaji Yahuza Abubakar; Vice President Bashir Kabore, who is also the Secretary of State of (inaudible); and the other elders of the Yankasa. They have welcomed me into their place of worship, they have welcomed me into their home. They have seen and done so much great work in my community, from -- from cleanups to ensuring those who are needy have a place to stay. And I'm thankful for their organization for all they do in my district.

Gentlemen, thank you, and please offer the cordialities of the floor.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Certainly. On behalf of Mr. Dais, the Speaker and all the members, gentlemen, we welcome you here to the New York State Assembly, extend to you the

privileges of the floor. Our thanks and congratulations for the work that you're doing in our City. Please continue that great work, and know that you always are welcome here and always will have friends here. My pleasure.

(Applause)

Ms. Darling for the purposes of an introduction.

MS. DARLING: Okay. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

For over 30 years, the Regional Alliance for Small Contractors, also known as RASC, has been a public-private partnership inclusive of large governmental agencies such as the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey, MTA, and many more throughout New York State. The organization is categorized as a 501(c)(3) non-profit, established to assist the growth of small minority, women, disadvantaged and local business enterprises. RASC achieves its objective by promoting the advancement of these firms and their development and management. They also promote policies and practices that improve the competitive position of minority businesses and expand the capacity of these firms to undertake contracts of increasing size and complexity. As we recognize our MWBEs in New York State here today in Albany, I cannot think of a better time to recognize this incredible organization.

Mr. Speaker, will you please extend the cordialities of the House to my beautiful guests?

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Certainly. On behalf of Ms. Darling, the Speaker and all the members, we welcome you

ladies here to the New York State Assembly. We extend to you the privileges of the floor. We are so pleased that you're sharing your day with us. I know we've had special events today. Understand how important it is that you continue the great work that your organization is doing, and we're just delighted to have you. Thank you so very much, and be welcome.

(Applause)

Ms. Seawright for the purposes of a introduction.

MS. SEAWRIGHT: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I rise today to introduce a special guest, Sandra Wilkin. She was reappointed by Governor Kathy Hochul as Vice Chairwoman of the Board of Trustees of the City University of New York in June of 2023 and confirmed by the State Senate. She is the first female graduate of both a CUNY community college, Kingsborough, and a senior college, Hunter, to serve as Vice Chairwoman of the Board. She is Chief Executive Officer of Bradford Construction. This construction management firm she founded in 1989, based on a mission to optimize services and operations on complex large-scale building projects. She was the cofounder of the Women's Builders Council, an organization that advances the role of women in the building industry, and the first woman to serve on the Board of Directors, the Executive Board of the New York Building Congress. She is a graduate of Kingsborough and Hunter College with a degree in nursing and New York University.

Please welcome her to the Chamber today. Thank

you, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Certainly. On behalf of Ms. Seawright, the Speaker and all the members, Sandra, we welcome you here to the New York State Assembly, extend to you the privileges of the floor. Thanks for that great career that you've given the State of New York, the City of New York. Continue your great work, you are always welcome here. Thank you so very much.

(Applause)

And again, Ms. Seawright.

MS. SEAWRIGHT: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I rise to introduce a special guest on behalf of Assemblyman Harvey Epstein and myself. I introduce Mike Schweinsburg, who has lived and worked successfully all over the country, Europe and Africa before deciding 25 years ago to devote his life to activism and community service. Originally a full-time volunteer for the Antiviolence Project, Mike turned his attention to political activism and community service which led him to disability advocacy, specifically the 504, the nation's first and largest advocating for the civil rights of people with disabilities. He organized New York City's first Disability Rights Parade for exceeding the administration's expectation of 500 to 800 people attending, when over 3,500 proud people with disability marched and rolled down Broadway to further be entertained by three hours of music and dance at the Disability Pride Parade Festival. Since then it has become an annual event. Mayor de Blasio proclaimed declaring July as Disability Pride Month,

and that was awarded to Mike for his continued advocacy to make it happen.

Please welcome him to the Chamber today. Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Certainly. Again, on behalf of Ms. Seawright, the Speaker and all the members, we welcome you here to the New York State Assembly, extend to you the privileges of the floor. Our thanks and congratulations for the contributions you've made to the City and the State. Continue that work, know that you are always appreciated here. Thank you so very much for being with us.

(Applause)

We will turn to resolutions on page 3. The Clerk will read.

THE CLERK: Assembly Resolution No. 2085, Ms. Hyndman.

Legislative Resolution memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim April 2024, as Minority Health Month in the State of New York.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: On the resolution, all those in favor signify by saying aye; opposed, no. The resolution is adopted.

THE CLERK: Assembly Resolution No. 2086, Mr. Raga.

Legislative Resolution memorializing Governor

Kathy Hochul to proclaim April 23, 2024, as Book and Copyright Day in the State of New York.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: On the resolution, all those in favor signify by saying aye; opposed, no. The resolution is adopted.

THE CLERK: Assembly Resolution No. 2087, Ms. Rosenthal.

Legislative Resolution memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim May 2024, as Be Kind to Animals Month in the State of New York.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: On the resolution, all those in favor signify by saying aye; opposed, no. The resolution is adopted.

THE CLERK: Assembly Resolution No. 2088, Mr. Durso.

Legislative Resolution memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim May 3, 2024, as Skilled Trades Day in the State of New York.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: On the resolution, all those in favor signify by saying aye; opposed, no. The resolution is adopted.

THE CLERK: Assembly Resolution No. 2089, Ms. Barrett.

Legislative Resolution memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim May 4, 2024, as Volunteer Firefighters'

Appreciation Day in the State of New York.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Ms. Barrett on the resolution.

MS. BARRETT: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I proudly -- proudly rise today to celebrate Volunteer Firefighters' Appreciation Day in recognition of the dedicated men and women who valiantly serve all of our communities. In my own district there are 42 fire companies, most of which are volunteer-run. There are more than 100,000 volunteer fighter -- firefighters across New York State, and they are often from the same families for generation after generation, beloved members of our community. The people who run towards the fire, who rescue our family pets, our family treasures and our family members when we are in crisis. And while they are volunteers in the sense that they're not paid, they are professionals who train, often at their own expense, sacrifice time with family and friends, and serve in many, many cases for decades. Volunteer firefighters provide vital life-saving services while saving New York State taxpayers \$4 billion a year. Were we to be paying for these volunteers for their services, it would cost us \$4 billion in additional taxes. And many of these firefighters suffer from financial instability themselves, despite the efforts that they serve and the work that they do for our community. Our volunteer firefighters are declining in number, and it's vital that we provide incentives to recruit and retain our next generation of volunteer firefighters. And while it's my privilege to acknowledge and support these firefighters through this resolution, it's also important

that we pass our Rescue EMS package which includes legislation that I have proposed which would allow volunteer firefighters to claim both the New York State Volunteer Firefighters and Ambulance Workers Income Tax Credit as well as a local property tax exemption. This package of bills will help all our communities, many of whom are -- are -- firefighters and EMS workers are precluded from some of the benefits that we want to see them have that will encourage and help with recruitment.

In my district and all throughout our State, we are immensely grateful for the sacrifices and hard work of these heroic men and women, and I ask my colleagues to join me today in honoring our volunteer firefighters. Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you.

Ms. Walsh on the resolution.

MS. WALSH: Thank you, Mr. Speaker, and thank you to the sponsor for bringing this resolution forward. This is a really important one. As -- as a member from the Upstate area, our -- almost all of the fire departments and fire services in my district are volunteer, and as the -- as the sponsor said, some are doing better than others. These are family -- these are families, multigenerational families in many instances that are getting involved. So my -- my father-in-law was a -- a chief in West Colesville, a really small district down in Broome County, and when my husband and his brother turned 16 they became junior firefighters. And that's very often how you see it go. I also want to give a big thank you to the families of

these volunteers because, you know, whether it's a holiday -- there are a lot of cold meals, there are a lot of meals left uneaten because of the calls. And we, as the Legislature, of course want our firefighters to be well-trained, so there have been a lot of additional training requirements that have been placed on these volunteer departments. So not only do they have to meet their basic -- the basic skills, but they have to go on for so much additional training that it is asking an awful lot of our firefighters. But they do it, they do it proudly. We're -- we're very proud of them and very happy for them.

So I -- I want to again thank -- I do -- I do appreciate our volunteer firefighters and I'm sure the members of this Chamber do as well. Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker, and thank you again to the sponsor.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you.

On the resolution, all those in favor signify by saying aye; opposed, no. The resolution is adopted.

THE CLERK: Assembly Resolution No. 2090, Ms. Bichotte Hermelyn.

Legislative Resolution memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim May 6, 2024, as MWBE Advocacy Day in the State of New York.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: On the resolution, all those in favor signify by saying aye; opposed? The resolution is adopted.

THE CLERK: Assembly Resolution No. 2091, Ms.

Pheffer Amato.

Legislative Resolution memorializing Governor Kathy Hochul to proclaim May 7, 2024, as Police Memorial Day in the State of New York.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Ms. Pheffer Amato on the resolution.

MS. PHEFFER AMATO: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I rise today to honor the lives of the police officers who made the ultimate sacrifice for our State and community. May 7th is Police Memorial Day in the State of New York, which allows us to commemorate and reflect on the selfless contributions made each day by police officers. In 2023 we lost 15 police officers in New York. To the families of our police officers, the only words I could express is how proud you must be that you had a husband, wife, brother, sister, child, someone who had the character to stand up and say, *I want to protect and serve the community*. There is not a lot of people who are actually willing to do that. To the families of our fallen officers, your loved ones -- your loved one was the embodiment of good and what it truly means to be a hero. Let me be clear: The police do good work. And to the officers and their families I say thank you. While we cannot bring those heroic police officers back, I hope this resolution brings some form of comfort to the families as we in this Chamber are saying with one loud unified voice, thank you to our police officers. Thank you for your commitment, thank you for your dedication, and thank you for your sacrifice to ensure all of us are able to thrive in a

safe, free and just society.

Once again, thank you to the police officers in our great State. To those who we have lost, may their memories always be a blessing. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you.

Mr. Reilly.

MR. REILLY: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. On the resolution.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: On the resolution, sir.

MR. REILLY: Thank you to the member for sponsoring this. You know, there's 1,840 names that are etched on that Police Memorial Wall in our Capital. Approximately -- I'm sorry, 1,108 of those names etched in that wall were members of the New York City Police Department. I wish we would never have to add another name to that wall, but the sad reality is that we continue to do that each and every year. And over the past 22 years, we keep adding names who perished due to the attacks on 9/11. Many of those names that are etched into that wall died several years after the attack, and we will continue, sadly, to add more names each and every year. So it's our gratitude to those families, to those colleagues who sacrificed, who gave their lives to protect and serve our communities.

You know, I had the honor of wearing the New York City Police Department uniform. It's one of the proudest things I've ever done. So many of those names, I knew them. And I want them

know that they will remember them forever. Fidelis Ad Mortem;
Faithful Unto Death.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you.

On the resolution, all those in favor signify by saying
aye; opposed, no. The resolution is adopted.

On page 5, Calendar No. 422, the Clerk will read.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A03980-A, Calendar
No. 422, Jackson. An act to amend the Insurance Law, in relation to
requiring insurance coverage for lactation consultant services.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Read the last section.

THE CLERK: This act shall take effect January 1st.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will record
the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

Mr. Goodell.

MR. GOODELL: Thank you, sir. I will be
supporting this bill because I think the cost is very modest and the
benefits can be significant. I would want to point out to my
colleagues, however, that every year we add several additional
mandates on every insurance policy in the State of New York. And as
a result, it is impossible in the State of New York for hardworking
men and women or employers to buy an affordable basic policy.
Every single policy offered for sale in the State of New York through
-- through our normal system requires you to buy abortion coverage

even though you may no longer be of childbearing age and may not even support abortion. It requires you to pay for a series of coverages that you have absolutely no interest in buying whatsoever. And the problem is the cost of insurance drives -- it keeps driving up. We have one of the highest insurance costs in the nation. It makes it less and less affordable for our friends and neighbors to be able to afford insurance that meets their needs. So remember, every time we vote for a new mandate, we're voting to increase the cost of insurance to all of our friends and neighbors and all the employers in the State of New York, and at some point we need to do that cost-benefit analysis and maybe say you ought to be able to buy the insurance coverage that you need for your family, meeting your needs, and not be forced to pay for a Cadillac system that many of our hardworking friends and neighbors cannot afford.

This one is very cheap, I believe, and so I've done the cost-benefit analysis at least in my own mind. I'll support it, but we need to be very mindful that we incrementally are driving the costs of insurance to a point where it's unavoidable -- unaffordable for many of our friends and neighbors. Thank you, sir.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you.

Ms. Jackson.

MS. JACKSON: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. On this bill. This bill is very personal to me because I remember being pregnant with my son and being in the hospital and learning how to breastfeed for the first time. And I don't know if you guys remember,

but last year, or maybe it was the year before, Mr. Speaker, we ran out of formula. We were running, hunting, asking people in different cities and states to send us formula if they found it. And I thought that it was imperative that we do this bill, that people learn how to feed their children. And we all know that breast milk is the best milk, right? So we want to encourage moms the best way possible to get that nourishment for their children. So I thought this bill was extremely important. It's personal to me and to every parent. We want to make sure that our children are raised healthy, and we want to make sure that moms know how to take care of their child and feed their child in the beginning stages of life. Lactation consultants are extremely important to that, and I want to thank you for allowing me to speak on this bill.

I vote in the affirmative.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Are there any other votes? Announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.)

The bill is passed.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A04853, Calendar No. 423, Ramos. An act to amend the Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation Law, in relation to prohibiting the mandated use of credit cards as a means of payment to use certain facilities at a State park, recreational facility or historic site.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Read the last section.

THE CLERK: This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

Are there any other votes? Announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.)

The bill is passed.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A04921-C, Calendar No. 424, Paulin, Weprin. An act to amend the Family Court Act, the Domestic Relations Law and the General Business Law, in relation to surrogacy programs and agreements.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The bill is laid aside.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A06026, Calendar No. 425, Cunningham, Beephan, Dickens, Zebrowski, Taylor, Gunther, Burdick, Conrad, Clark, Sillitti, Sayegh, Anderson, Vanel, Wallace, Fall, Ardila, McMahon, Santabarbara, Eachus, Shimsky, Tapia, Hevesi, Simon, Aubry, Buttenschon, Alvarez, De Los Santos, Gibbs, Lucas, Jacobson, Meeks, Barrett, Raga, Novakhov, Bendett, Durso, Gandolfo, McDonough, Tague, Slater, Morinello, DiPietro, Simpson, E. Brown, Mikulin, Gray, McGowan, Maher, Floor, Miller, Hawley, Angelino, Blumencranz, Brabenec, DeStefano, Chang, Simone, Weprin, Kelles, Dinowitz, Levenberg. An act to amend the Family Court Act and the Criminal Procedure Law, in relation to Orders of Protection.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The bill is laid aside.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A06992-A, Calendar

No. 426, Dickens, Taylor, Reyes, Aubry, Sillitti, McDonough, Smullen, Simon, Burdick, Buttenschon, Cunningham. An act to amend the Veterans' Services Law, in relation to providing certain support for veterans to help alter their discharged status.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Read the last section.

THE CLERK: This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

Mr. Gibbs.

MR. GIBBS: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I rise on behalf of member Inez Dickens. She says she called in just to say thank each and every one of you. The veteran bill is very important to her. Veteran services is very important to her and her family as well as her district. She says to each and every member she loves each and every one of you guys, and thank you on behalf of Inez Dickens.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Are there any other votes? Announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.)

The bill is passed.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A07194, Calendar No. 427, Dilan, Dickens, Taylor, Walker, Davila, Ardila, Hyndman, Lucas, Septimo, Reyes. An act to amend the Correction Law, in relation to certificates of relief from disabilities.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The bill is laid aside.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A07241-A, Calendar No. 428, Lavine, Norris, Pirozzolo, Jensen, Wallace, Brabenec, Gunther, Bronson, Tapia, Lunsford, McMahon, Weprin. An act to amend the Executive Law, in relation to limiting recordkeeping and reporting duties of public notaries.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Read the last section.

THE CLERK: This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

Mr. Norris to explain his vote.

MR. NORRIS: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I would just like to take this opportunity to offer my support of this bill, and also say a lot of times you hear negative things about partisanship in Washington and here in Albany. But this is a great example of working together across both sides of the aisle. And I want to thank the Chairman of the Judiciary Committee, Chuck Lavine, who worked with me on this bill. And what it does is it has the exemption for the notary publics so they no longer need to keep a log except for when they do remote notarizations. And this, I believe, is a very good bill primarily for our democracy, for people who are going out and gathering petitions, but also in the private sector where we have notary publics acting in law firms and our banks and insurance agencies. And this has been a burdensome regulation when, quite frankly, they take an oath -- oath of office to uphold that being a notary public.

So I think this is a very good bill. It will reduce the burdensome regulations on our notary publics, promote democracy, and I also say again, my thanks to the Chair of the Judiciary Committee, Chuck Lavine, for his bipartisan work on this very good bill. Thank you very much, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Norris in the affirmative.

Mr. Lavine to explain his vote.

MR. LAVINE: So, I -- I usually get to stand and argue with sometimes people on my own side of the aisle, and very often with people on the other side of the aisle. But I think it's really important for anyone who is watching or paying attention to this to realize that there is a strong spirit of community amongst us in this Chamber, no matter where we sit. And I want to thank Michael Norris for actually thinking up this bill because I didn't think up this bill. And I'm always happy to vote in favor of a Lavine/Norris bill, or maybe this is a Norris/Lavine bill. Thank you, Michael.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Lavine in the affirmative.

Are there any other votes? Announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.)

The bill is passed.

Mr. Goodell for the purposes of a introduction.

MR. GOODELL: Thank you very much, sir. We are very fortunate to have visiting with us some special guests. With us

are the wife, son -- sons and mother-in-law of our colleague Jarett Gandolfo; his wife is Natalia, his sons are Lenny and Benjamin -- both better dressed than I am -- his mother-in-law Debbie. And if you would please extend the privileges of our floor. Both sons are ready to speak on the next bill, no doubt. But they are certainly honored guests here. If you'll extend the privileges of the floor to these distinguished guests.

Thank you, sir.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Certainly. On behalf of Mr. Goodell, the Speaker and all the members, we welcome Lenny and Benjamin here to the New York State Assembly. It's appeared to us that we have all of our youngsters joining us today, at least some of our youngsters, and we're happy to have your mom and stepmother [sic]. We're pleased that you have joined us today, you are family, you are always given the extension -- the pleasures of the floor. And Lenny and Benjamin, you will have them for many, many years. Thank you and welcome.

(Applause)

The Clerk will read.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A07790-A, Calendar No. 429, Solages, Bichotte Hermelyn, Weprin. An act to amend the Insurance Law, in relation to expanding coverage requirements for human donor milk.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The bill is laid aside.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A08081-A, Calendar

No. 430, Bores, Lee, Burdick, Sillitti, Weprin. An act to amend the Civil Practice Law and Rules, in relation to requiring proof of service to include the server's perception of various characteristics of the recipient in the description of the person to whom personal service of a summons was delivered.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The bill is laid aside.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A08324, Calendar No. 431, Rajkumar. An act to amend the Court of Claims Act, in relation to allowing for dismissal of a claim based on claimant's failure to comply with pleading requirements.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The bill is laid aside.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A08452-A, Calendar No. 432, O'Donnell, Colton, Burdick, Gunther, Thiele. An act to direct the Departments of Environmental Conservation and Health to establish environmental standards for ambient lead and lead contamination in soils; and providing for the repeal of such provisions upon expiration thereof.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The bill is laid aside.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A08978-A, Calendar No. 433, Woerner, Gunther. An act to amend the Arts -- Arts and Cultural Affairs Law, in relation to requiring the Council on the Arts to have members from each of the ten regions of the State.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Read the last section.

THE CLERK: This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will record

the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

Are there any other votes? Announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.)

The bill is passed.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A09169, Calendar No. 434, Burdick, Raga. An act to amend the Correction Law, in relation to establishing an annual heat mitigation plan; and directing the Extreme Heat Action Plan Work Group of the Department of Environmental Conservation to analyze the impact of extreme heat on incarcerated individuals and people working in prisons.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The bill is laid aside.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A09186-A, Calendar No. 435, Dilan, Dickens, Taylor, Walker, Davila, Ardila, Hyndman, Lucas, McDonough, Reyes. An act to amend the Correction Law, in relation to providing for the return of any identification materials to an individual upon release from custody.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Read the last section.

THE CLERK: This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

Are there any other votes? Announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.)

The bill is passed.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. 93 --

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: One minute, one minute. Hello? Ladies and gentlemen, we can't hear. Thank you. Proceed.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A09329, Calendar No. 436, Jackson, Burdick. An act to amend the Real Property Law, in relation to requiring landlords and lessors provide notice to tenants about bed bug infestation.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The bill is laid aside.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A09336, Calendar No. 437, Seawright. An act to amend the Mental Hygiene Law and the State Finance Law, in relation to expanding the legislative reporting requirements for the Office of Mental Health and the Office for People with Developmental Disabilities.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The bill is laid aside.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A09386, Calendar No. 438, Pheffer Amato, Colton, Dilan, Santabarbara, Davila. An act to amend the Civil Service Law, in relation to crediting of provisional time for promotional examinations.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: On a motion by Ms. Pheffer Amato, the Senate bill is before the House. The Senate bill is advanced. Read the last section.

THE CLERK: This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

Are there any other votes? Announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.)

The bill is passed.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A09827, Calendar No. 439, Barrett, Santabarbara. An act to amend the Public Service Law, in relation to information required to be published prior to a major rate change by a public gas or electric utility.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Read the last section.

THE CLERK: This act shall take effect on the 60th day.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

Are there any other votes? Announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.)

The bill is passed.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A09850, Calendar No. 440, Jean-Pierre, Burdick, Cunningham. An act to amend the Veterans' Services Law and the Vehicle and Traffic Law, in relation to veterans receiving information on benefits.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Read the last section.

THE CLERK: This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

Are there any other votes? Announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.)

The bill is passed.

We will go to page 18, Calendar No. 93, the Clerk will read.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A03499-B, Calendar No. 93, Carroll, Stirpe, Reyes, Taylor, Dickens, DeStefano, Ramos, Mikulin, Sayegh, Smith, Williams, Cook, Seawright, Reilly, Miller, Rozic, Epstein, Cruz, Steck, Ra, Benedetto, Jacobson, Hyndman, Thiele, Lavine, Stern, Jones, Buttenschon, Braunstein, Fall, Paulin, L. Rosenthal, Wallace, Dilan, Aubry, Jean-Pierre, Darling, Walker, Anderson, Jackson, Raga, Burgos. An act to amend the General Business Law and the Vehicle and Traffic Law, in relation to automobile broker businesses.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Read the last section.

THE CLERK: This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

Mr. Carroll to explain his vote.

MR. CARROLL: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. This bill will bring much-needed transparency and consumer protections to the auto broker business, and in turn will make sure that New York consumers, when they're using a broker to purchase a car, that they're

getting the best price, that their financial data is protected, and that they can be assured that they're getting the best value for this major purchase.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker, and for that I rescind my vote -- I rescind my abstention and vote in the affirmative.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Carroll in the affirmative.

Are there any other votes? Announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.)

The bill is passed.

Page 9, Rules Report No. 18. We are on debate. The Clerk will read.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A04938-D, Rules Report No. 18, Dinowitz, Raga, Hevesi, Colton, Bores, Simon, Glick, Seawright, Otis, Fahy, Lee, Weprin, Pretlow, Fall, L. Rosenthal, Lupardo, Pheffer Amato, Ardila. An act to amend the General Business Law, in relation to the manufacture and sale of lithium-ion batteries for use in light electric-powered vehicles, personal electric mobility devices and limited-use motorcycles.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: An explanation is requested.

One minute, Mr. Dinowitz. We will need a little more quiet while we're debating, please. Members take their seats, settle in.

Proceed, Mr. Dinowitz.

MR. DINOWITZ: So this bill prohibits the manufacture, distribution, assembly, reconditioning, sale or offering for sale of a lithium-ion battery or a second-use lithium-ion battery intended for use in an e-bike, moped or other micro-mobility device unless the battery -- unless -- it prohibits -- unless the battery is certified by an accredited testing laboratory. Now, we passed the C-version of the bill recently, and this version just makes a few very minor tweaks to the bill in order to secure -- in order to make sure it becomes law.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Goodell.

MR. GOODELL: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Would the sponsor yield?

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Dinowitz, do you yield?

MR. DINOWITZ: Yes, I do.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Dinowitz yields.

MR. GOODELL: Thank you, Mr. Dinowitz. Am I correct that New York City already has a local law dealing with this? Or a Citywide law?

MR. DINOWITZ: Right. Well, New York State doesn't have this law.

MR. GOODELL: But New York City has something similar, doesn't it?

MR. DINOWITZ: I'm not sure that what I would characterize what New York State has as similar. This bill addresses a

serious problem, because as you know, as we discussed last time, many people have died because of defective lithium-ion batteries, particularly people in New York City. In fact, there was just a fire within the past couple of days in the Bronx again. I don't know that anybody died from the fire, thankfully. But too many people have died and hopefully this bill can help address that situation.

MR. GOODELL: Well, in particular, doesn't New York City's Local Law 39 deal with this subject?

MR. DINOWITZ: New York State?

MR. GOODELL: New York City.

MR. DINOWITZ: New York City.

MR. GOODELL: Local Law No. 39.

MR. DINOWITZ: New York City -- I thought you said New York State.

MR. GOODELL: No, New York City, sorry.

MR. DINOWITZ: Okay. Well, you know, New York City is one very important part of the State, but not the whole State. New York City does have a law, but this covers the whole State, and if I must say so myself I think it's even better.

MR. GOODELL: And you've mentioned some examples of these battery fires in New York City which already has similar provisions. Are you aware of any battery fires outside of New York City where they don't have this local law?

MR. DINOWITZ: Well, I don't have data or anything like that, but I can't imagine that these fires only happen in New York

City. I mentioned New York City because I'm most familiar with that. But I'm pretty sure that outside New York City, people are not immune to those fires that take place in New York City because the reason for the fire is not the fact that it's in New York City, but the fact that they are defective lithium-ion batteries.

MR. GOODELL: Now, looking at New York City as the example since they passed a similar law, Local Law 39, how many citations has New York City issued under its local law, do you know?

MR. DINOWITZ: No, I don't.

MR. GOODELL: Well, I note that the enforcement provision of this bill relies solely on district attorneys, county attorneys and Corporation Counsel. Let me start with district attorneys. Is there any criminal sanctions associated with this?

MR. DINOWITZ: Well, let me check. But keep in mind, we already passed the C-version of the bill and the changes that were made from C to D don't include the areas that you're talking about.

MR. GOODELL: And I appreciate it, and I voted against the C-version as well. But in my question, is there any criminal sanctions associated with this?

MR. DINOWITZ: I don't believe they are criminal sanctions -- well, let's see here, let's just check. The DA, county attorney and corp counsel shall have concurrent authority to seek relief in this section, and all civil penalties obtained in any such action shall be retained by such municipality or county.

MR. GOODELL: So this is not enforced by traffic officers, police officers or anyone that carries a badge, unless maybe a district attorney carries a badge; is that correct?

MR. DINOWITZ: Well, again, while that's not relevant to the areas that differ between the two sections, I would say yes.

MR. GOODELL: I see.

This also applies to all existing micro-mobility vehicles, if you will, that have batteries that aren't UL or EN certified, correct?

MR. DINOWITZ: Yeah.

MR. GOODELL: So that means, then, if you already own one of these bicycles you can't sell it?

MR. DINOWITZ: Well, I think in the previous debate Ms. Walsh brought up the very same issue, as I recall, and the answers would be the same. So I would refer you back to that debate, yes.

MR. GOODELL: So the answer is yes, you can't sell it or no, you can't sell it?

MR. DINOWITZ: If it's defective, no.

MR. GOODELL: And likewise --

MR. DINOWITZ: N-O, no.

MR. GOODELL: -- I know there's a lot of opportunities sometimes in cities where you can rent a bicycle, I think you can also rent an e-bike. This would bar anyone from renting an

e-bike that has a battery that's not UL or EN certified, correct?

MR. DINOWITZ: Yes. You do not want people using any -- anything that has these defective batteries which can cause people to die.

MR. GOODELL: Now, a lot of the fires were caused, according to some experts, because of improper charging. Does this address in any way the chargers or a requirement that the charger be consistent with the original manufacturer's recommendations or that it be charged in a certain way?

MR. DINOWITZ: Well, first, the -- the answer I believe is no. But I don't know that the reason for these fires is because of improper charges or exclusively because of that. There may be various reasons why we've had these fires, but the -- the fact is we have had the fires and people have died from it. And I think as the Legislature we would want to take action that would help save lives. I'm sure you would agree with that.

MR. GOODELL: Does this provide -- does this provide any compensation for any existing consumers that may have, for example, just re-bought or remanufactured or recertified a battery that can no longer use that e-bike or micro-mobility vehicle? Does it provide any compensation to offset the fact that their purchase is now worthless?

MR. DINOWITZ: Well, no, you wouldn't want to impose that kind of burden on the -- on the taxpayers who have to pay for that compensation, I'm sure.

MR. GOODELL: Well, you know, that's the same argument that applies in the Constitutional prohibition against taking government -- it basically says if you take the entire value of my personal property, you have a Constitutional obligation to pay. That's the Taking Clause of the U.S. Constitution. But this doesn't provide any funding for that, correct?

MR. DINOWITZ: Oh, you mean for the defective batteries?

MR. GOODELL: Right.

MR. DINOWITZ: No, it doesn't.

MR. GOODELL: It's not necessarily defective, it's not certified -- not UL or EN certified, correct?

MR. DINOWITZ: You mean for the potentially defective and possibly death-causing batteries? The answer is you're correct, that it does not provide compensation.

MR. GOODELL: Now of all the uncertified batteries, that is batteries that have not been tested, what percent of them have ignited?

MR. DINOWITZ: I don't know, but I would imagine a fairly low percentage because most people don't have batteries that explode on them, but some do, and most people aren't dying, but some have.

MR. GOODELL: So the last data I saw is that in New York City, which has a comparable law in place, there were like 25 fires in the last two years or three years; is that right?

MR. DINOWITZ: I think it's probably more, but it's -- but I'm sure that's not out of the ballpark.

MR. GOODELL: And that's out of the hundreds of thousands of bicycles -- or I don't know if it's hundreds of -- well, yeah, it was -- it was estimated at 60,000 of these bicycles out there, right?

MR. DINOWITZ: I don't know the number, but I'm pretty sure 60,000 is fewer than hundreds of thousands.

MR. GOODELL: Yeah, well, 60,000 just for delivery. That was the number that did not include personal use.

Thank you very much, I appreciate your clarification, sir.

On the bill.

MR. DINOWITZ: One -- one thing you didn't do is ask what change between C and D, but you don't have to, that's okay.

MR. GOODELL: Well, I -- I wouldn't want you to feel slighted in any way, but so what is the change between the C-version and the D-version?

MR. DINOWITZ: I'm glad you brought that up. And I don't feel slighted. So these are the minor differences: So, the definition of lithium-ion battery was changed based on experts of government and industry. In other words, we slightly altered the -- the definition in there. Number 2, the definition of moped was removed, but mopeds are still covered in the bill but the reference is to their term of -- to the term of limited-use motorcycles, which is defined in

the Vehicle and Traffic Law. And third and last, we added to the products and devices covered -- covered being those that are sold to add to those that are leased or rented. So it's sold, leased or rented. And that's it.

MR. GOODELL: Thank you, and I'm glad you clarified those differences.

MR. DINOWITZ: It's my pleasure.

MR. GOODELL: Sir, on -- on the bill.

ACTING SPEAKER LAVINE: Mr. Goodell on the bill.

MR. GOODELL: This is an interesting bill because it in 90 days would basically eliminate the value of anybody who has an e-bike or a micro-mobility device which is the -- is similar to a moped, but slightly different as my colleague noted. And in 90 days you wouldn't be able to lease that, you wouldn't be able to sell it, and the value would drop to near zero.

Now, we know there's been problems with some of these batteries. Those have been highlighted. We've had roughly, I think, 25 fires in the last couple of years in New York City, which already has this law. It actually already has a stricter law than this. So this is an interesting proposition for us to vote on because New York City, leading the way, has a stricter law, it hasn't been effective at all. So we're asked to render all these private e-bikes and mobility devices that use a battery which hasn't given them any problem and there's likely over 100,000 of them in New York State, we're asked to render

them all worthless. So you can't sell them or rent them or use them. But the irony on this whole bill is that it's only enforced by district attorneys, county attorneys or corporation counsels. Well, having served as a county attorney I can tell you, we don't have an investigatory staff that's out there on the road checking e-bikes. No one does. City corporation counsel doesn't have an investigatory staff. They don't even have -- most of them don't even have any badge or anything like that, and they certainly don't have any authority to arrest or make anything of that nature. And then we ask district attorneys who are busy prosecuting laws and trying to get criminals off the streets to enforce this? What, is the DA gonna do a neighborhood survey? So we have a bill that's completely -- virtually completely unenforceable, that's proven and practiced to be totally ineffective, that renders many bicycles worthless and eliminates the ability of anyone to sell, lease or rent.

So for those reasons I'm not supporting it. But as my colleague noted earlier, a very similar version of this passed with substantial bipartisan support, and I suspect to his great pleasure it will happen again. Thank you, sir.

ACTING SPEAKER LAVINE: Read the last section.

THE CLERK: This act shall take effect on the 90th day.

ACTING SPEAKER LAVINE: The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

Mr. Palmesano to explain his vote.

MR. PALMESANO: Yes, Mr. Speaker -- Speaker, to explain my vote. I know I debated the bill last time, I don't think it's necessary to do it again. I just wanted to highlight a couple of points that I brought up in the debate and reasons for my opposition. I understand why the sponsor is doing this legislation. I -- we've seen similar bills because of the EV -- because of the fires in New York City in apartments with scooters and e-bikes because of the lithium-ion batteries. This is a bill that's reacting to those tragedies. I want us to be proactive, and it's too late to be proactive on this side of the -- on these issues. But I'm very concerned about our electric vehicles, our electric school buses that are on the road and they're gonna continue to be on the road. What are we doing to ensure the purity, the safety of those batteries? We already know that cobalt is used to produce lithium-ion batteries, we already know that cobalt is extracted in the Democratic Republic of Congo and that they're using child labor to produce these lithium-ion batteries to power electric vehicles, to power our electric school buses. So why aren't we talking about that and being proactive on that side of the equation? We also know that lithium, as that's mined in African countries, are poisoning water, rivers and streams. In those countries there is birth defects and other issues that are going on and from that perspective. Why aren't we being proactive on that regard? Unfortunately, it just seems like more and more the other side of the aisle and the Administration

wants to promote this electric -- full electrification in this so-called "clean agenda." And there's nothing clean about it, you should know that. And you talk about trying to get to a -- reducing global emissions, and the fact of the matter is New York only contributes 0.4 percent of all global emissions, 0.4, while China contributes 30 percent, has 1,000 coal plants and building more. So we can talk about this, this is a nice bill to try to address the problem with the scooters and bikes, but we have a problem with our electric vehicles and our -- and our school buses that are gonna happen. They need to make sure those batteries are safe and being sourced with products that are here in the United States instead of the Congo and other African countries. And also we got other issues that we have to be aware of; battery storage fields --

(Buzzer sounds)

ACTING SPEAKER LAVINE: Mr. Palmesano, how do you vote?

MR. PALMESANO: I will vote no, Mr. Speaker, thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER LAVINE: Thank you, Mr. Palmesano.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Are there any other votes? Announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.)

The bill is passed.

Calendar No. 232, the Clerk will read.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A08232-A, Calendar No. 232, Paulin, Sayegh. An act to amend the Public Health Law, in relation to expanding eligibility for appointment to county boards of health and health services advisory boards.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Read the last section.

THE CLERK: This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

Are there any other votes? Announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.)

The bill is passed.

Page 30, Calendar No. 312, the Clerk will read.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A07872-A, Calendar No. 312, Paulin. An act to amend the Public Health Law, in relation to providing health care proxy information to palliative care patients.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Read the last section.

THE CLERK: This act shall take effect immediately.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

Are there any other votes? Announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.)

The bill is passed.

Page 34, Calendar No. 379, the Clerk will read.

THE CLERK: Assembly No. A09407-A, Calendar No. 379, Weprin, Levenberg. An act to amend the Insurance Law, in relation to supplemental spousal liability insurance.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Read the last section.

THE CLERK: This act shall take effect on the 180th day.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

Are there any other votes? Announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.)

The bill is passed.

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Mr. Speaker, do you have any further housekeeping or resolutions?

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: We have both, Mrs. Peoples-Stokes. We'll start with resolutions [sic].

On behalf of Ms. Paulin, bill A06034-A, Assembly bill recalled from the Senate. The Clerk will read the title of the bill.

THE CLERK: Assembly -- an act to amend the Public Health Law.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Motion to reconsider the vote by which the bill passed the House. The Clerk will record the vote.

(The Clerk recorded the vote.)

The Clerk will announce the results.

(The Clerk announced the results.)

The bill is before the House and the amendments are received and adopted.

Resolution 2093, the Clerk will read.

THE CLERK: Assembly Resolution No. 2093, Mr. Lavine.

Legislative Resolution commemorating the observance of Holocaust Remembrance Day in the State of New York on May 6, 2024.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Lavine on the resolution.

MR. LAVINE: Thanks, Mr. Speaker. Across the world today, hundreds of thousands of people, Jews and non-Jews, are lighting candles in memory of the six million Jewish lives lost in the Holocaust. We should also pause to remember on this Yom HaShoah all the Roma, the Sloves, those with disabilities, LGBTQ individuals and others who were murdered in the Nazi genocide, the ritualized slaughter of the other. But we should also remember, even in the face of this tragedy, the many heroes who rose during those darkest of times, including the one-and-a-half million Jewish troops who served in the Soviet Army, in the American Army, and in the British Army, and that number does not include the partisans who lost their lives fighting the Nazis. It does not include the ghetto fighters, and there were uprisings in every one of the ghettos. For those who lost their

lives in the uprisings in the camps.

In a world that today seems to face more than our fair share of despair, we must never waiver in our commitment to fight hatred wherever it exists. We must speak up in the face of oppression. We must speak up. We cannot be innocent bystanders. There is no such thing as an innocent bystander. We must be upstanders. Wherever we see hatred, we must stand up and we must fight. We don't have much choice; history teaches that -- teaches us that. So I ask that each of us take this moment to reflect on all of those whose lives were ended needlessly during those Nazi years, and let's make sure that it doesn't happen again.

Now, we have recently seen a problematic spike in Jew hatred in the United States and throughout the rest of the world. We cannot stand idly by while that occurs, nor can we stand idly by while hatred is expressed towards the other. And the other include not only Jews, Blacks, Latinos, migrants, immigrants, LGBTQIA+, trans kids. Let us stand strongly. The history of the Jews in the United States has largely been a great history. There have been exceptions in the 20's and the 30's. All you had to do was turn on a radio and you heard vehement anti-Jew hatred. We thought we had left those days behind. But unless and until all of us stand together and stand united, we are in danger. America is based on the proposition that each of us is inherently equal. Today, in order to defend America we must stand up for the Jews and we must stand up for the other as well. The -- the fate of the Jews and the fate of America are inextricably intertwined.

And there's a Jewish expression that goes back to the end of the Second World War. It's (speaking Yiddish). It's a Yiddish expression, a Hebrew expression. It means the people of Israel, the Jews, survive.

So as we reflect on the Holocaust on Yom HaShoah, let us keep in mind not only Am Yisrael Chai, but Am America Chai; the people of Israel must live and the people of America must live.

Thank you for letting me address this -- this issue.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, sir.

Mr. Weprin on the resolution.

MR. WEPRIN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. You know, every year Holocaust Remembrance Day, Yom HaShoah, we use the expression "never again", that this could never happen again, should never happen again. For many years I thought, you know, that was not even a remote possibility. But what we've seen here in the United States and even in New York State since October 7th, is an increase in hate crimes against Jewish people. In 2024 alone, I think NYPD came out with a statistic that hate crimes against Jews are up 45 percent just this year alone, not to mention all the hate crimes that we hear about nationally and internationally. So to remember the Holocaust, you know, people say that if we don't remember the Holocaust, if we don't remember history and what happened, we're -- we're due to repeat history, and in this case that should never happen again. October 7th was the worst single day of murder of people because they are Jewish since the Holocaust. And the increase in hate crimes after the Hamas murder and torture and rape of innocent people, you know, you'd think

that that would provoke sympathy for the Jewish people, for the State of Israel, but unfortunately, it's the opposite. It's brought out hate, and what's happening now in the United States is similar to what happened in Nazi Germany and related countries prior to the Holocaust. So it's very important that we all speak out against hate against anybody or any group. But in this particular case it's important to remember the Holocaust and to prevent it from ever happening again. And we need to be vigilant and not just sit by, but speak out about all the anti-Semitism that is happening throughout college campuses, not to mention everywhere we turn in New York and the United States.

Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Ms. Levenberg.

MS. LEVENBERG: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. As we recognize the Shoah today with a day of remembrance, I cannot help but think about how important it is for us to learn lessons from history, as my colleagues have mentioned. I would not be here today if not for the kindness of righteous Christians who took it upon themselves to put their own lives on the line to save my family. We know of many stories like these, many, many, many stories. Fear of those who are different than us or have different beliefs is crippling our world. Only through opening our arms, our hearts and our minds we will be ever be able to move past terrorism and war. And not just here, not just in Israel, but throughout our world. We must remember and we must do much, much better.

Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you.

Ms. Glick on the resolution.

MS. GLICK: Thank you, Mr. Speaker, on the resolution. The Holocaust did not start with trains heading to Auschwitz. It started many, many years before with laws that restricted the ability of Jews to be teachers, of Jews to own businesses, of Jews to have certain other professions. Those restrictions were embraced by a government. Those were government actions, a determination by a government that a whole people should be exterminated. That -- that is what genocide is. And it was shocking to people that their neighbors turned on them, people that they had been friends with. People who their kids had played with were no longer going to play with their children. That chased them down the street, that knocked them down. The Brownshirts who would run through the streets and beat up obvious observant Jews. And then came Kristallnacht, The Night of Broken Glass, where the storefronts which had been painted over with signs "Juden" so everybody knew what businesses were owned by Jews. Then they came through and they broke the windows. For many of us, the scenes that have been happening on college campuses have felt like America's Kristallnacht; a shock that so many of the people in our own communities don't understand that there is but one Jewish state in the world. Many of us don't live there. We've been disbursed. We've been disbursed from everywhere we've lived because we'd been driven out. We were driven out by the pogroms, we were driven out from many corners of

the world.

Israel started as a refugee state. And now because of terrorists and the most horrific attacks on people, youngsters at a music festival, just like the youngsters on college campuses, mowed down, shot repeatedly to make sure. Last week I went and saw some footage that was taken from the terrorists' own phones that had been seized by Israelis, the defense force. And then the first responders. It's not what we have seen on TV. And I -- I feel for the people of Gaza who are also victims of Hamas. But it is chilling, chilling to us to think that in our universities, the people who will be the future leaders of our country, that this is what they think is okay; to see youngsters on college campuses wearing Hamas bandanas. I never thought of Israel as Plan B, but a lot of people in Europe do. And it is calculated. This slaughter was calculated to bring on the assault by Israel, the response by Israel, in order to make Israel a pariah nation, and we cannot, cannot allow that to go forward and unchallenged. Because it started with the terrorists.

Now, not everything that the Israeli government has done is something I agree with. And of course the loss of lives in Gaza is horrific. But it started with a terrorist attack, and those of us who live in New York City and live in New York State should understand really personally what happens when it starts with a terrorist attack and whether or not you have the right to respond.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

(Applause)

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you.

Mr. Ari Brown.

MR. A. BROWN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. As the son and grandson of Holocaust survivors, my mother and grandmother from Italy, and when Mussolini joined Hitler they had to escape. My mother was born in Milano. They escaped to Sicily and eventually made their way to America thoroughly vetted, yet they were interred for 18 months right here in Oswego, New York in a barbed wire interment camp. They weren't let out because just like the Japanese, they weren't sure of the loyalties of the Italians. But growing up I heard the full stories, my mother, it's my grandmother, immediate families killed babies, killed before their eyes. And we always heard "never again", but like my colleague said, it actually just did happen again. We had the land of Israel, we always did. We were there for thousands of years, but now we have an official state that we thought was recognized by the world. Unfortunately, we realized it's not recognized by many. I think, you know, people would have, you know, thought of "never again" and thought about all the atrocities and think about how we're 15 million people, not a fraction of a percent of the world's population, and yet even that's not good enough. They want to destroy even that. We haven't contributed enough to the world in science and mathematics and every facet of life? What is it about the Jewish people that the world looks to destroy? If it was any other group and every other group that Jewish people were the first during times of segregation to stand up for others, where are the

people standing up for us? If the Ku Klux Klan would have come into Columbia, believe me, it would have ended in about 30 seconds. But Jewish blood has always been cheap. Let's remember that and really remember it this time, never again.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you.

(Applause)

Mr. Slater.

MR. SLATER: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. Hard to follow my colleague Ari Brown, Assemblyman Brown and his comments, but I just wanted to take a moment and remember and recognize someone who I had the privilege of meeting, Esther Geizhals. Esther Geizhals and my colleague Assemblyman Weprin and I have a connection here. But I had the distinct honor of welcoming Esther to the Yorktown Town Hall during one of our Holocaust Remembrance ceremonies, and she described in detail the harrowing experiences that she had during the Holocaust. And I think it's really important for us to all remember the fact that as each year passes, we're losing those connections, we're losing those voices. And to think back to hear the fear still in her voice, to see the tears still coming down her cheeks. I brought my six-year-old son to that presentation, and my son Charlie still remembers Mama Esther to this day. And I think that is something that we need to do better as a society, is educating our children of the realities and the atrocities of what occurred during the Holocaust. There's gonna to be these types

of ceremonies across New York State. I know there were some in my district over the weekend and there will be more in the coming days. And I just want to urge all of my colleagues to take the time, take the time to go visit, to go hear straight from the survivors themselves because it brings a whole new perspective, a whole new emotion that you may have never experienced before.

And with that I want to thank the sponsor of the -- of the resolution, and once again as we always say, may we never forget and may we always work together to make sure we never forget. Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Thank you, sir.

Mr. Epstein.

MR. EPSTEIN: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I just want to thank the sponsor of this resolution. You know, it's kind of interesting, in world history I think Jews have always had tough times and this feels like one of those really, really tough times. But thinking about what happened in the Holocaust and what happened to -- to my ancestors, to my family, it's really important to this day to stand up and acknowledge Holocaust Remembrance Day. Hard to ignore all the atrocities that happened across the globe to people who are innocent, and the Holocaust is just one example of horrific acts by humans on other humans. In today's times, the moment that we remember what humanity did to each other, it's a moment we can't forget. And it's important for us to be here to think about the lives, the six million Jews, but the millions of others who -- who were -- who

perished in the Holocaust. And the ability of all of us now to stand up against hate and tolerance and bigotry, and that's what we need to do today. And I applaud the sponsor in moving this resolution forward.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Brook-Krasny.

MR. BROOK-KRASNY: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I just -- I want to share with you, Mr. Speaker, and with my colleagues a conversation that I had yesterday. I have in my district not too many anymore, unfortunately, but a few Holocaust survivors and I had a conversation with them yesterday. They had in one of the developments, Luna Park Development, we had -- we have a Holocaust Survivors Synagogue. So I visited them and I had a conversation with them. And Mr. Speaker, I have -- I have some experience in politics and I know my district very well, and usually I know how to respond to the questions from my constituents. Yesterday I just didn't know what to say, because they were asking me how that can happen in the country and they expressed the love for this country. They expressed the respect for the government. But they were asking me how that can -- could happen in -- in the universities where kids are supposed to be the smartest. I didn't know how to respond. And then they -- they asked me if my colleagues in the parliament, do they understand in the State parliament, do you understand what's going on in New York City, what's going on in -- in this country? I didn't know what to say. I didn't know how to answer the question. And then they asked me who is going to protect us again. And I'm saying it now to you, Mr. Speaker, to my colleagues

and I have goosebumps because I didn't know what to say to them.

Let's never forget.

Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Steck.

MR. STECK: Very briefly, Mr. Speaker. Since we have had some discussion of current conditions, of course the Holocaust occurred in Europe, but I think there's a temptation to see the State of Israel other than it is. It is not a European State. Fifty percent of the population of Israel are Brown and Black people. People who were driven out of countries in the Middle East, in North Africa, in Eastern Africa because they were Jewish. And this is not a -- strictly a European White phenomenon, it extended to Jews all over the world.

Thank you.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: Mr. Novakhov.

MR. NOVAKHOV: Thank you, Mr. Speaker. I'm Jewish, but you don't have to be Jewish to see the difference between light and dark, between darkness and the light. And I think every normal person sees and understands what is going on right now. I would like to briefly thank those who fight, those who fought against fascism in the country I was born, in the Soviet Union, and I have a lot of many, many veterans who fought in Russia. I would like to thank the American soldiers who fought against fascism, and I would like to thank those who fight against the modern fascism today. Thank you very much, very much to all the fighters.

Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: On the resolution, I'd ask us all to rise.

All those in favor signify by saying aye; opposed?
The resolution is adopted.

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes, we have numerous other fine resolutions which we will take up with one vote.

On the resolutions, all those in favor signify by saying aye; opposed, no. The resolutions are adopted.

(Whereupon, Assembly Resolution Nos. 2064-2084 and 2092-2103 were unanimously approved.)

Mrs. Peoples-Stokes.

MRS. PEOPLES-STOKES: Mr. Speaker, I will never forget. However, now I move that Assembly stand adjourned and that we reconvene at 2:00 p.m., Tuesday, May the 7th, tomorrow being a Session day.

ACTING SPEAKER AUBRY: The Assembly stands adjourned.

(Whereupon, at 5:20 p.m., the House stood adjourned until Tuesday, May 7th at 2:00 p.m., Tuesday being a Session day.)